

Ripot Namba 53280-PG

Inspeksion Panel o
Komiti Bilong Glasim



Ripot na Stia Tok

PAPUA NEW GUINEA:
Developmen Projek Bilong Ol Liklik Fama
(Smallholder Agriculture
Development Project)
(IDA Namba long Dinau 43740 – PNG)

Mun Mas, De 10, Yia 2010

Inspeksion Panel
Komiti Bilong Glasim

Ripot na Stia Tok
Long
Askim ikam long Komiti Bilong Glasim

Developmen Projek Bilong ol LiklikFama
(*Smallholder Agriculture Development Project*) Papua New Guinea
(IDA Credit namba 43740-PNG)

A. TOK I GO PAS

1. Long de 8, mun Disemba na yia 2009, wanpela pas askim ikam long Komiti Bilong Glasim. Dispela askim blong glasim na skelim developmen project bilong fama (Smallholder Agriculture Development Project – SADP) we Intenesenel Developmen Asosiesen (International Development Association - IDA)¹ givim dinau moni long en. Dispela askim ikam long Senta bilong Envairomen Lo na Komuniti Rait (Center for Environmental Law and Community Rights-CELCOR), wanpela NGO bilong Papua New Guinea husat go pas long wanpela grup ol kolim Ahora/Kakandetta Pressa Grup, wanpela mausman bilong papa graun insait long Oro provins, em i wanpela lain papa graun wantaim ol liklik fama we projek i stap long en, narapela tupela ples we projek bai kamap, em i no bin salim pas tok long Komiti Bilong Glasim. Ol lain husat go pas long askim i tokaut olsem ol kisim bikpela bagarap na bikpela bagarap moa yet long kain mak na we projek save wok. Ol lain husat salim pas tok long askim CELCOR long stap mausman bilong ol, no laikim nem bilong ol i stap long dispela ripot.
2. Komiti luksave long dispela askim long de 17, mun Disemba long yia 2009; ol bosman long projek kisim tok orait long IDA long surukim taim na bekim tok CELCOR i bin mekim long mun Febuari, de 8 na yia 2010.
3. Tok orait long kamapim Komiti Bilong Glasim i bin kamap long hap 19 long yia 1993². Na as tingting bilong dispela ripot bilong painim aut dispela askim i bihainim stretpela rot long wok painim aut, na painim aut bai go het o nogat.

B. DISPELA PROJEK

4. As tingting bilong dispela projek em blong halivim fama kisim moa moni long oil pam bilong ol, na lukautim sindaun bilong ol fama husat go pas long lukautim oil pam na tu iken planim moa oil pam.³ Sampela we bilong halivim ol i olsem: lukautim ol han rot

¹ For the purpose of this Report, IDA is sometimes referred to as "the Bank".

² International Development Association, Resolution No. IDA 93-6, dated September 22, 1993 (the "1993 Resolution").

³ 3 Infilling refers to new blocks of oil palm being planted between established blocks of oil palm along existing access roads in the Nucleus Estate Scheme (NES) areas.

blong kisim oil pam i go long ples bilong salim, na lukautim ol arapela gutpela pasin bilong sindaun gut long ples.⁴ Dispela projek i gat tripela (3) hap ples by wok i kamap insait lo Oro na West New Britain Province insait lo faifpela yia.

5. Long bihanim kontrak long kisim halivim moni, bikpela as tingting bilong Projek em blong mekim kamap bikpela, na long skel we ol inap long lukautim gut, na tu olgeta pipol insait long komuniti insait we projek stap iken pulim moa moni long lukautim ol yet⁵.
6. I gat tripela we long halivim karim kaikai ol bikpela tok stap long namba 5 antap⁶;

Namba 1: Bilong halivim ol fama kamap strong na bikpela (US\$18.9 million IDA); (a) ol fama iken planim moa oil pam long 9000 hekta graun stap nating arere long rot, (b) stretim na mekim 550 kilomita rot nau stap kamap bikpela na putim hap moni long lukautim rot gut long bihain, (c) Ananit long Oil Palm Industry Corporation (OPIC) strongim ol wokman husat save long oil pam iken go raun na halivim ol fama long lukautim gut oil pam.

Namba 2: Strongim Ol lokol gavman na sapotim ol long Wok Wantaim Komuniti (US\$3 million IDA)

Dispela wok go pas long sapotim na strongim sevis iken kamap gut insait long tupela provins Oro wantaim West New Britain we komuniti wok bung wantaim long wok iken kamap strongpela tru.

Namba 3: Long Bosim na Lukautim Projek (US\$5.6 million IDA)

Dispela hap bilong sapotim wok bilong Oil Palm Industry Corporation long lukautim na halivim ol fama mekim bisnis bilong ol kamap gut na strong; na tu halivim ol husat kisim kontrak long mekim hap namba 2 wok gut; na strongim ol oil pam lain olsem Growers Association na PNG Oil Palm Research Association; na tu givim moni lukluk gen insait long mak ol putim long putim pe long Fruit Bunch Formula⁷; na tu salim ol wokman long go bek long skul long kisim masta digri⁸.

7. Olgeta moni bilong projek i kam inap olsem US\$68.8 Million. Insait long dispela, IDA putim US\$27.5 million na dispela moni em wankain long \$17.7 million we projek i gat rait long usim moni. Ol arapela lain putim moni long dispela projek em, PNG Sustainable Development Program (PNGSDP) putim US\$10.2 million, Wet New Britain Provinsel Gavman US\$7.2 million. Oro Provinsel Gavman US\$3.5 million, Oil Pam Milling Kompani putim US\$5.7 million na ol liklik⁹ Oil pam bisnis lain putim US\$7.3 million¹⁰.
8. Ol Bod bilong IDA tok orait long dinau bilong IDA long 18 de, Disemba long yia 2007. Dispela tok orait bai karim kaikai long de 28, Januari 2009. Projek bai pinis long

⁴Project Appraisal Document (PAD), Report No: 38558-PNG, dated November 19, 2007, p.3.

⁵ Financing Agreement (Smallholder Agriculture Development Project) between Independent State of Papua New Guinea and International Development Association, dated July 9, 2008.

⁶ PAD, p.4.

⁷ The Fresh Fruit Bunch (FFB) is the primary unit of measure for oil palm sales.

⁸ The Road Maintenance Trust Fund is a user pay based funding mechanism for road maintenance.

⁹ According to the PAD (p. 5), the bulk of the smallholder financial contribution for the Project is their share of the proposed Road Maintenance Trust Fund levy.

¹⁰ Management Response - Request for Inspection of the Papua New Guinea: Smallholder Agriculture Development Project (IDA 43740-PNG), February 8, 2010, p. 10

Disemba 31, long 2012. Ripot bilong ol meneja itok, dispela projek i no kirap hariap bikos ol i no sainim kontrak kwiktaim.

9. Long ripot¹¹ bilong wok “skelim projek” (Project Appraisal Document – PAD) i toksave, secta bilong oil pam stap long oil pam bilong kampani na Gutpela sindaun wantaim ol Liklik fama.tupela lain wok klostu wantaim OPIC. Na dispela tripela (1) Kompani bilong milim oil pam, we ol i gat oil pam bisnis bilong ol yet na wok klostu wantaim ol liklik oil pam bisnis man long kisim oil pam pastaim na baim bihain, halivim ol pipol long karim oil pam ikam long mil, (2) ol man long ples husat i gat liklik oil pam bisnis na (3) ol OPIC lain. Projek i gat tripela hap ples wok i stap, (1) Popondetta insait long Oro provins, (2) Hoskins long West New Britain na (3) Bialla tu long West New Britain. Dispela ples i gat tripela kain projek; Esteit (Kampani) we wanpela projek bosim olgeta samting, oill pam projek bilong ol lain ples we ol kantrak wantaim papa graun na lukautim oil pam (Village Oil Palm - VOP), na namba tri lain en ol lain kam long narapela hap na kam sindaun long blok we ol planim oil pam long wanwan blok (Land Settlement Scheme - LSS).
10. OPIC bai go pas long dispela projek. Wanpela komiti i kamap pinis long givim stia long mekim dispela projek go het. Seketeri bilong Nesenel Plening bai stap siaman bilong dispela komiti na ol wanwan wokman bilong ol gavman dipatmen bai sindaun long dispela komiti. Ol dipatmen olsem Tresori, Agrikolsa, Envairomen, Woks, Provinsel na Lokol Level Gavman, Komuniti Developmen, Provinsel Developmen, na Sustainable Development program bai go pas.

C. OL LAIN ASKIM

11. Ol Tok kam bihain long hia givim as tingting bilong wanpela pas long askim long skelim na glasim projek (Annex I.).
12. Hap tok 1. Insait long dispela askim, ol luksave olsem dispela SADP projek i bin kamap bihain long narapela oil pam projek long yia 2003. Wol Benk i bin givim halivim moni long PNG Gavman long wanpela projek ol kolim “Oro Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project” stat long yia 1992 na pinis long 2001. Ol pasim dispela SADP projek long 2003 na holim stap. Lo yia 2006. ol kirapim dispela projek ge. Ol lain husat raitim dispela pas long glasim dispela projek ting olsem sampela senis ikamap namel long yia 2003-2006. Nambawan tingting blong dispela projek em bilong mekim oil pam bisnis kamap bikpela tasol husat go pas long dispela projek senisim dispela na yusim moni long stretim rot na planim wan wan likilik oil pam blok arere long rot.
13. Long lukluk bilong ol lain raitim pas ol i ting olsem nambawan hap bilong dispela projek we bai ol givim dinau long ol likilik fama husat laik planim oil pam arere long rot. Dispela hap graun slip nating na nogat oil pam stap long en. Dispela pasin bilong givim dinau long planim oil pam arere long rot ol kolim “infilling” em I giaman na trik pasin long kamapim oil pam bisnis bikpela. Dispela kain pasin bai mekim bilong ol man iken rausin bus we ol pipol save wokim gaden na kisim kainkain halivim long bus. Ol husat ratim pas luksave olsem 9,000 hektas graun stap yet long planim moa oil pam. Ol ting

¹¹ PAD, p.19

olsem sapos yu lukautim gut ol oil pam bai ol karim moa yet. Olsem na ol i no ken pulim moa gruan long planim nupela oil pam.

14. Ol husat raitim pas i gat bikpela hevi long oil pam bisnis olsem, oil pam bisnis i no save halivim ol fama long sindaun gut na lukautim ol yet. Ol husat mekim liklik bisnis long oil pam i no save gut long ol hevi bilong oil pam bisnis long wamen ol i no save tokim ol. Pastaim ol i mas klinim bus long planim oil pam. Bai i no i nap kisim halivim moa na ol lusim bus olgeta. Na tu taim diwai long bus pinis and graun stap nating, graun save bruk nabaut na bagarap olgeta, na ol wara i bagarap long marasin ol i usim long lukautim oil pam.

15. Ol lain Askim luksave long sampela bikpela hevi ikam pinis long oil pam projek:

(i) **Tok long stap Rabisman (Poverty Impacts):** Ol husat askim long glasim projek luksave olsem Wol Bank putim bikpela moni long dispela oil pam projek we projek stap longpela taim tasol i no halivim ol pipol tumas. I gat ripot ananit long dispela projek we ol lukim olsem ol i no kisim halivim long oil pam projek. Ol i no kisim gutpela halivim long sindaun gut long gutpela haus, o healt sevis drinkim klinpela wara. Nogat, sindaun bilong ol pipol i bagarap moa yet. Tu ol luksave taim ol skelim wantaim ol arapela bisnis olsem kopi, kopra, na oil pam save pulim planti moni tasol dispela i no halivim ol pipol.

Ol lain raitim pas tokaut strong olsem ol liklik fama i no i nap lukautim sindaun bilong ol kamap moa beta bikos kontrak bilong skelim moni ol pulim i no stret. Ol papa bilong mill o papa bilong masin bilong brukim sid bilong oil pam i save kisim bikpela hap na papa long liklik oil pam save kisim liklik moni tasol. Tu ol luksave olsem long ol lain long ples i ken pulim moni long wanpela rot i no bihainim pasin na tingting blong Wol Benk. Wol Benk laik lukim ol lain bilong ples pulim moni long kainkain we. Bikos ol lain bilong ples planim oil pam long graun bilong ol, olesem na hat long mekim narapela kain we long pulim moni. Na tu bikos ol lain long ples mas baim takis long lukautim oil pam, ol tu imas baim takis i go long lukautim rot. Lukluk long ol lain raitim pas i olsem kain takis ol imas baim mekim ol kamap wokman nating na i no halivim ol gut long sindaun bilong kamap moa beta.

(ii) **Mekim Toksave na Bung Wantaim:** Ol raitim pas i tok olsem Wol Benk wantaim husat go pas long projek i no toktok wantaim ol lain long ples na ol arapela insait long komuniti. Ol kainkain toksave long olgeta lain long komuniti long wanem kain projek bipo long projek i stat. Ol mekim wanpela tok save tasol na i no toksave long olgeta lain long ples na ol i bin tok long Inglis tasol. Ol lain husat raitim pas i wari olsem tok save i no go long planti long ol ples bipo long tok orait. Dispela pasin ol mekim i no stret na mekim ol wari. Ol tok moa olsem Wol Benk i no askim tingting bilong ol papa graun wok bilong dispela pam oil projek. Na tu ol i no tok klia long takis moni ol lain long ples bai baim long lukautim rot insait long projek. Sapos ol pipol i gat gutpela save pastaim bai ol i no inap long kirapim oil pam. Bai ol i nap long mekim narapela kain bisnis long lukautim ol yet. Na tu Wol Benk wok long tok olsem bipo long dispela wok kirap ol i bin mekim gut toksave tasol ol i no i nap soim gut wanem taim na de ol mekim dispela. Olsem na bipo long projek i stat luk olsem pipol i no save gut long dispela projek na tu luk olsem ol planti i no klia. Olsem na luk olsem planti pipol i no klia tumas long mekim disisen. Olsem na dispela projek i no kisim planti sapot bipo long dispela projek i kamap.

(iii) **Strongim Projek:** Ol lain raitim pas i wari long tupela bikpela samting, nambawan samting olsem takis moni ol kisim long lukautim rot na namba tu samting em ol lain long OPIC. I luk olsem ol husat go pas long kamapim projek i no tingim gut na plenim gut long stap longpela i nap long projek pinis. Ol lain rait na tok olsem rot i wok long bagarap na tu ol arapela projek we Wol Benk sapotim oil pam na wokim rot long en em tu bagarap. I nogat gutpela plen na gutpela tingting i go pas bihain long ol wokim rot. Long tingting bilong ol lain raitim pas tok olsem rot ol wokim long sapotim dispela ol oil pam projek no nap stap longpela taim bikos PNG gavman na oil pam i no save givim hap moni olgeta taim long lukautim gut ol rot. Narapela wari blong ol lain raitim pas i tok olsem OPIC no gat save na em i no strong long wok bilong ol; na tu OPIC nogat ol wokman long raun wanwan ol liklik wokman husat lukautim oil Pam na halivim ol. Bikpela asua ol lukim em dispela, takis moni bilong pipol bilong PNG bai baim rot we ol i bin wokim bipo. Nau dispela projek bai baim gen long lukautim rot na tu ol lain long ples husat mekim lilik bisnis long oil Pam na usim rot bai baim takis long lukautim rot. Dispela i no stret bikos ol pipol bai baim tripela taim long lukautim dispela rot. Tok i stap we insait long narapela projek stap bipo ananit long Wol Benk, ol kolim “World Bank Oro Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project” ol i no wokim klostu long 180 kilomita rot na ol lain long ples stap nating. Olsem na AusAid lain givim moni long wokim ol arere rot we dispela projek lusim stap. Nau dispela projek i no i nap stretim bikpela hap, em liklik hap tasol olsem 100 kilomita rot AusAID i bin wokim bipo.

(iv) **Bagarap Long Graun:** Ol lain Raitim pas tok olsem ol husat wok painim aut mekim long skelim wanem kain bagarap iken kamap long graun na bus i no mekim wok stret. Ol i no skelim wanem kain bagarap bai kamap long pis, wara na ol pipol taim ol kapsaitim pipia bilong Oil Pam Mil. Tu ol luksave olsem dispela wok painimaut lusim planti samting na i no putim i go inasait long ripot bilong ol. Man husat go pas long wok painimaut na raitim ripot i no go long ples we ol i nap kisim gutpela tingting long halivim ol, ol i no tok klia long aumas wara mas mikis wantaim pipia bilong oil pam na bihain kapasaitim i go long wara, ol i no luksave gut na tok stret wanem kain we na pasin oil pam projek i ken mekim long pulim moa graun na bagarapim ol bush. Na ol lain i raitim pas tokaut long wanpela seve long ol Gutpela bus mas kamap bifo ol i planim nupela oil pam.

16. Long Pinisim tok: Ol lain Askim tok, dispela Oil Pam projek abrusim planti polisi bilong Wol Benk na bai: (a) Sotim gutpela sindaun long ol pipol na tok strong long ol long kamapim planti oil pam tasol ol i yet luksave olsem oil pam i no i nap pulim bikpela moni na lukautim gutpela sindaun bilong ol lain long ples, (b) bai bagarapim wara (c) bagarapim bus (d) bai i no i nap mekim ol sindaun gut na i no strongpela tumas long stap longpela taim (e) na bai mekim ol liklik fama husat lukautim oil pam long baim takis long lukautim rot na sotim ol.

17. Ol usat Raitim pas i bin raitim planti pas na tokim Wol Benk planti taim long dispela hevi na tu soim kopi bilong ol pas i bin raitim. Tasol ol i no kisim wanpela gutpela bekim bilong pasim ol nogut samting stap long list i stap antap.

18. Moa yet, ol lain raitim pas tok ol i mas pasim dispela Projek i nap long: (a) ol painim rot we Oil Pam halivim pipol long pulim gutpela moni long halivim sindaun bilong ol, (b) Halivim painim narapela rot long painim moni na lukautim gut ol lain long ples, (c) ol

mas skelim gut olgeta kain kain we dispela projek i ken bagarapim graun, na we long mikisim pipia bilong oil pam wantaim wara na posin i noken bagarapin graun, na tu skelim gut ol bus; (d) i mas senisim we bilong dispela projek so projek iken stap longplela taim; (e) na tu ol husat go pas long dispela projek imas go raun long olgeta ples na kisim tingting bilong ol man long dispela projek na sapos ol tok orait long dispela projek em bai moa beta bikos ol save na mekim disisen bihain.

19. Long toktok i go pas, ol lain raitim pas askim ol Komiti Bilong Glasim i mas wok painimaut long olgeta olgeta askim i bin mekim pinis long en.

20. Olgeta tok stap antap wantaim ol arapela tok, Wol Benk i no bihainim stretpela pasin na rot long mekim wok:

OP 1.00	Poverty Reduction <i>Lukluk gut long sindaun bilong ol pipol</i>
OP/BP 4.01	Environment Assessment <i>Lukluk gut long bus na graun</i>
OP/BP 4.10	Indigenous Peoples <i>Yumi yet. Ol man na meri bilong ples</i>
OP/BP 4.36	Forests <i>Bus em i no bagarap, na ol I no bin kutim diwai</i>
OP/BP 4.04	Natural Habitats <i>Bus em in no bagarap na stap gut</i>
OP/BP 10.00	Investment Lending <i>Givim Dinau</i>
OP/BP 13.05	Project Supervision <i>Lukautim Projek</i>
OMS 2.20	Project Appraisal <i>Lukluk gut we ol I bin skelim Projek</i>

D. BEKIM BILONG OL BOSMAN (WB Management)

21. Ol dispela bekim bilong ol bosman¹² na kopi bilong olgeta tok mipela putim wantaim long dispela ripot (Annex II.)

22. **Stia tingting:** Long tingting bilong ol bosman bilong Oil Pam projek, Wol Benk i bin wok wantaim oil pam projek insait long PNG long stat long yia 1969 we nambawan projek bilong Wol Benk i bin kamap. Ol Bosman luksave olsem taim Wol Benk givim dinau moni long kamapim fopela (4) oil pam projek bipo long SADP¹³. Ol Bosman long Oil Pam luksave olsem Wol Benk i kam bek gen long wok wantaim PNG long yia 2005 bihain long tupela yia wok slip nating stap. Nogat wok ikamap insait long tupela yia bikos ol wanpela projeck ol i kolim Forestry and Conservation projeck (lukautim Bus na Graun)

¹² 12Management Response - Request for Inspection of the PNG: Smallholder Agriculture Development Project ((IDA Credit No. 4374-PNG), February 8, 2010.

¹³ These are New Britain Smallholder Development Project 1969-1973 (Phase 1) and 1970-1976 (Phase 2); Popondetta Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project (1976-1984); Nucleus Estate and Smallholder (Milne Bay) Project (1985-1992); and, Oro Smallholder Development Project (1992-2001).

bin bruk long 2001¹⁴. Ol luksave olsem Oil Pam bai halivim gutpela sindaun bilong pipol. Long daunim kaikain bagarap long graun bihain long ol kirapim nupela oil pam projek, Wol Benk wok long halivim ol lilik oil pam bisnis long oil pam i ken karim planti na halivim ol long kisim oil pam i go long Oil Pam fektori na tu stretim ol rot. Ol bosman bilong PNG Oil Pam tokaut olsem Oil Pam save halivim planti manmeri sindaun gut. Na tu ol tok planti man na meri¹⁵ save painim wok insait long Oil Pam bisnis na i kamap namba 2 long givim wok insait long PNG. Oil bilong pam save pulim planti moni i kam insait long PNG na i wok long kamap bikpela insait long tripela ten yia (30). Ol lukim traipela senis kamap long dispela faifpela (5) yia i go pinis.

23. Wol Benk¹⁶ Pasim Wok oil pam long Novemba 2009, ol bosman long Projek luksave olsem Wol Benk pasim tok long noken sapotim Oil Pam bisnis. Tasol dispela i no i nap senisim SADP projek bikos wok i bin kirap pinis na tu dispela projek bai skelim na luksave long kainkain hevi save bungim gutpela sindaun bilong ol pipol long ples na graun bilong ol we oil pam bisnis stap long en¹⁷.

24. Ol bosman tok olsem SADP sapotim ol plen bilong gavman bilong PNG (2005-2010) na tu ol luksave long hevi na asua i bin kamap bipo. Wol Benk go pas na save long planti samting na ol kisim gutpela stia tingting long Wol Benk na tu ol luksave Oro Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project long 2001¹⁸. I bin i gat hevi long statim planti projek tasol mipela i nap long wokim sampela rot kwiktaim taim dispela traipela raunwin Guba bagarapim Oro provins long yia 2007. I bin i gat tambu long usim moni bilong IDA long kirapim gut ol projek tasol narapela wanwok PNGSDP halivim long stretim 35 kilomita rot.

25. **Bagarap iken Kamap long Projek:** Ol bosman tokout olsem dispela projek i gat bikpela tingting long wokim bisnis na tu sot tru long pulim moni na bihain bisnis inap long pundaun. Ol glasim na luksave olsem ol rot i no gutpela tumas na bai kisim takis long ol wanwan oil pam bisnis man na ol arapela hap long sapotim Oil Pam projek i no stap o i no fit. Ol Bosman long projek bilip olsem ol sampela hap long halivim projek i ken go het¹⁹. Na tu long 2008 Quality Assurance Group (QAG) mekim wok painim aut na luksave olsem SADP em wanpela gutpela samting long wok insait long PNG, tu ol painim aut olsem ol wok hariap tumas long wokim bisnis na givim dinau moni long arapela i no stret. Ol i nap long kisim planti halivim sapos ol redi gut olgeta samting pastaim lo wokim Road Maintenance Trust Fund (RMTF) na stretim gut na finisim ol toksave long ol kontrak lain²⁰.

¹⁴ Note on Cancelled Operation - Independent State of Papua New Guinea Forestry and Conservation Project, October 13, 2006.

¹⁵ The Management Response states that Oil Palm smallholders earn K2,793/ha and K 130/day worked, compared to other cash crops such as cocoa (K1,136/ha and K21/day worked) and coffee (K2,058/ha and K13/day worked).

¹⁶ For the purpose of this Report, World Bank Group is the International Development Association (IDA), the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD), the International Finance Corporation (IFC), and the Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency (MIGA).

¹⁷ Management Response, p. vii

¹⁸ Management Response, p. 10.

¹⁹ Management Response, p. 11.

²⁰ Management Response, p. 12.

26. **Mak bilong Projek:** Ol bosman toksave olsem PAD mekim bikpela asua na i no luksave gut bikpela hevi bai bungim ol sapos projek i no kirap hariap na tu amas taim bai ol kisim long kirapim OPIC long we bilong lukautim projek²¹. Ol bos tokaut olsem bod i bin tok orait long ol arapela projek olsem wokim nupela na stretim olpela rot, planim oil pam arere long rot, kirapim we long lukautim na givim sevis long wokim arapela we wantaim Community Driven Development (CDD) i no no kirap yet. Ol dispela wok by kirap klostu long mu Septemba long yia 2010²². Tasol ol bosman bilip olsem bikpela wok i bin kamap pinis long Oro provins we ol stretim ol rot, stretim sampela hap long planim oil arere long rot, bungim moni long kirapim projek, stretim rot long strongim²³ OPIC.
27. **Strongim gutpela sindaun:** Ol bosman bilip olsem Wol Benk bisnis long oil pam insait long PNG i kamapim gutpela samting olsem na bai mekim gut moa yet long gutpela we long lukautim graun na sindaun. Ol bosman tok olsem oil pam bisnis kirapim planti wok long ol man na nau mekim ol liklik oil pam bisnis pulim planti moni²⁴ long wok na graun bilong ol na winim ol arapela kain bisnis fama. Long tingting bilong ol bosman ol Viles Oil Pam (VOP) pulim klostu olsem K5,586 long tupela hektea blok graun long wanpela yia. Dispela winim ol arapela wokman husat save kisim K3,200 long wanpela yia na ol i wok fotnait²⁵ (o 200 de long wan wan yia). Ol bosman luksave olsem bai yu i no i nap wok hat tumas olsem ol arapela kain wok (43 de long wan wan yia tasol). Bai yu kisim moni tasol long wanwan fotnait. Ol bosman wanbel long ol man i mas usim graun long kainkain we long pulim moni olsem na lukluk bilong ol i olsem ol Viles Oil Pam haus lain i save pulim moni long ol arapela we tu. Olsem na projek bai saptim ol taim ol stretim ol rot gut.
28. Ol bosman bilip olsem i gat bikpela pe ol save kisim tasol sindaun bilong ol i no gutpela tumas. Dispela hevi em bilong olgeta hap long PNG na i no hevi bilong ol pipol husat go pas o stap ananit long Oil Pam projek. Dispela hevi stap bikos pipol save kisim moni na baim kainkain samting na skelim wantaim ol femili na wantok na i no save tingtim bihain na sevim moni. Na tu hevi save kamap bikos halivim bilong gavman i no gutpela tumas. Na tu ol planti lain save stap long blok (long LSS Blok) na mekim hat tumas long planim kaikai na lukautim oil pam.
29. Long tingting bilong ol bos long projek, ol husat lukautim oil pam mil save wok bung wantaim na kisim halivim gut. Mil kompani save rausim dinau moni wantaim fi bilong long ol liklik oil pam taim ol bringim oil pam i kam long fektori na dispela pasin halivim gut tru long bekim dinau long taim stret. Ol bosman tok klia olsem taim ol givim dinau moni i no blong mekim planti lain long ples lukautim na mekim oil pam bisnis. Tasol ol lain long ples i mas bihainim laik na tu imas bihainim sampela lo bilong planim na lukautim oil pam. Ol bos man bilip olsem ol lain Mama Lus Frut Scheme (MLFS)²⁶ by kisim bikpela halivim na ol hauslain tu.

²¹ Management Response, p. 11.

²² Management Response, p. 8.

²³ Management Response, p. 14.

²⁴ Management states the returns to oil palm at current prices are about K2,793/ha and K130/day worked, compared to about K1,136/ha and K21/day worked for cocoa and K2,058/ha and K13/day worked for coffee.

²⁵ Management Response, p. 17.

²⁶ The Mama Lus Frut Scheme (MLFS) is aimed at women in the smallholder areas. Collecting loose fruit is considered women's work but as women would not receive money from loose fruit collection, they preferred growing and selling vegetables. The MLFS provides women with harvest nets and a payment card known as the

30. Ol Bosman bilip olsem taim ol stretim ol arere rot, dispela bai halivim gut ol pipol long kisim sevis bilong gavman olsem skul na helt. Na tu hap namba 2 long dispela projek bai halivim lilik wok insait long komuniti long halivim sindaun gut, na kisim nupela trening na kainkain halivim. Bai ol painim liklik moni long sapatim ol pipol long ples long wok bung wantaim komuniti. Ol bosman bilip olsem dispela we by halivim gutpela sindaun bilong ol pipol stap klostu long projek²⁷.
31. **Fresh Fruit Bunch (FFB) Pricing Formula.** Ol Bosman tok klia long we ol usim Fresh Fruit Bunch long makim pe bilong oil pam. Ol lukim kost bilong lukautim oil pam na kost bilong lukautim ol mil na bungim wantaim na makim prais. Ol kamapim prais bilong baim oil pam i olsem, ol lukim pe ol baim bipo long oil pam karim kaikai insait long blok bilong ol liklik oil pam growa na kost bilong wanwan ton pam insait long ol Mil²⁸. Na tu ol lukluk long kost bilong karim oil pam ikam long mils na ol mils kamautim oil. Ol putim olgeta kost i go insait na putim prais bilong oil pam. Ol bosman luksave olsem we long usim FFB long putim prais save mekim bel nogut wantaim ol liklik growa na ol milling kompani. Sampela taim ol save lukluk gen long we ol makim prais. Long 2001 Wol Benk baim sampela lain long kam skelim projek bilong Oro Smallholder Development Project. Ol save putim FFB prais long olgeta mun na ol Miling Kompani save bihainim. Pe ol liklik growa kisim long oil pam bihain long Projek rausim ol arapela kost olsem masin, wokman, marasin long kilim gras²⁹, rent bilong graun sapos ol stap long blok, win moni sapos ol dinau, pe bilong stap memba long ol kain grup ol stap insait long en (olsem PNGOPRA, OPIC) na long haus sapos ol stap insait long haus bilong taim bifo dinau³⁰.
32. Ol bosman wanbel long tok olsem olgeta³¹ husat go pas long Oil Pam bisnis i mas makim pe bilong oil pam na bai lukluk gen ananit long dispela projek. Sampela senis i bin kamap long makim pe insait long luksave long 2001. Ol bosman laik kirapim dispela wok namel long 2010. As tingting long dispela wok bilong skelim gen mak na as tingting ol i gat long taim ol makim prais na sea namel long liklik oil pam blok lain wantaim ol mil-kompani³².
33. **Moni bilong Stretim Rot:** Ol Bosman tok klia olsem "Road Maitenance Trust Fund (RMTF) em i wanpela rot long halivim lukautim ol han rot³³. Dispela hap moni ikam long moni ol kisim long ol husat usim dispela rot olsem ol liklik oil pam bisnis lain, ol kompani long bruskim sid na kisim oil, na provinsial gavman.

Ol Bosman bilip olsem gutpela rot bai daunim kos long ronim trak na gutpela rot tu bai halivim planti lain long sindaun gut. Takis moni long RMTF, wankain olsem ol arapela takis ol kisim long olgeta liklik oil pam bisnis man bipo ol karim ikam long salim long fektori. Ol bosman long projek bilip olsem bel isi i stap wantaim liklik oil pam bisnis man

"mama card" which records their sales proceeds and deductions. Women now have an alternate source of income through the MLFS.

²⁷ Management Response, p. 21

²⁸ Management Response, p. 21

²⁹ The Sexava Hopper is an oil plam pest whose spread is controlled through a centralized effort by mill companies.

³⁰ Management Response, p. 22

³¹ Management Response, p. 62

³² Management Response, p. 22

³³ Management Response, p. 66

bai baim 25% wantaim provinsel gavman baim 25% and Oil Pam Mill baim 50% long takis³⁴. Bosman tu ting olsem ol liklik fama long oil pam bai baim bikpela moni liklik taim ol baim takis long lukautim rot tasol taim ol skelim olgeta wok luk olsem bai i gat traipela kakai bilong en long halivim olgeta³⁵. Ol Bosman tok olsem PAD tok klia long het tok long wok bilong ol RMTF³⁶ na ol i no pinisim wok bilong ol yet. Dispela toksave i stap wantaim dispela kontrak bilong Road Maintenance Trust Fund³⁷. Ol bosman tok gen olsem RMTF wok i no pinis yet na takis moni long rot na wok bilong RMTF bai kamap stret na ples klia bihain long ol sindaun wantain planti lain na olgeta tok orait long mak bilong takis moni³⁸. Dispela wok painimaut bai kamap long yia 2010.

34. Free Prior and Informed Consultations (FPIC) and Broad Community Support (BCS). Tok save long ol pipol, wanem kain projek bai kamap na kisim olrait long ol papa na mama bilong graun na husait bai stap insait long projek eria. Ol bosman bilip olsem taim ol redi long kamapim³⁹ dispela projek, ol i bin toktok wantain planti lain insait long komuniti olsem na planti luksave na sapotim dispela projek. Polisi bilong Wol Benk olsem, ol papa graun tasol i mas stap klostu long projek. PNG Gavman wokim wanpela skelim na luksave long halivim ol pipol sindaun klostu long projek long luksave gut na ol kisim gutpela toksave na lukaut gut long gutpela na nogut bilong dispela projek. Ol wokman bilong PNG gavman usat go pas long skelim sindaun save gut tru long Tok Pisin na statim wok long Jun 2006. Ol bosman long projek tok olsem, i bin i gat planti wok ikamap long toksave gut insait long tripela ples we projek i stap na long Port Moresby tu. Namba bilong ol pipol ol lain i bin wok wantaim na toksave long en kamap 550 olgeta. Ol toktok wantaim ol pipol wanwan, or long grup na tu ol bihainim pasin bilong ples tru long kisim tingting bilong ol pipol. Ol i no salim pas or mekim tok save long redio, nogat. Ol i go sindaun wantaim na toktok wantaim. Dispela we em gutpela na ol kisim toksave gut. Olsem na ol bosman long projek bilip olsem i gat bikpela sapot long ol pipol long dispela projek. Tu ol luksave olsem tru ol sindaun wantaim na toktok wantaim ol pipol tasol ol i no ripot gut wanep hap long projek ol ripotim long pipol, na tu hausat ol mekim ol toksave, na tu ol i no putim long ripot wanem hap ol i go long mekim tok save⁴⁰.
35. Na tu, ol bosman long projek i gat strongpela tingting olsem planti pipol sapotim projek insait ol triplela ples we Project bai kamap. Dispela soim laik bilong ol pipol⁴¹. Ol Bosman luksave long OP 4.10 olsem i mas i gat planti sapot bilong ol pipol stap klostu long ol projek na tu luksave long ol pipol i mas i gat luksave pinis bipo long toksave i ken kamap. Dispela i no min olsem bai i gat wanbel long ol projek i stap long ples⁴².
36. **Ol Toksave:** Ol bosman tok olsem long skelim sindaun bilong pipol, Sosiel Asesmen, Environem Asesmen wantain ol arapela i bin raitim ol pepa i bin dilim na givim olget pinis long Port Moresby na Washington long tok Inglis long mun Febuari long de 22 long yia 2007. Ol bosman tok stret olsem taim ol mekim dispela toksave, ol bihainim lo bilong Wol Benk⁴³.

³⁴ Management Response, p. 30

³⁵ Management Response, p. 33

³⁶ Management Response, Footnote 25, p.8.

³⁷ Management Response, p. 64

³⁸ Management Response, p. 23

³⁹ Management Response, p. 25

⁴⁰ Management Response, p. 27

⁴¹ Management Response, p. 31

⁴² Management Response, p. 32

⁴³ Management Response, p. 33

37. **Strongpela bilong Projek: Laip bilong Projek.** Ol bosman wanbel olsem projek bai ron gut na bai stap longpela taim sapos ol rot i gutpela we ol liklik oil pam fama inap long salim oil pam na ol kisim moni na lukautim ol yet gut. Dispela hap we projek stap i gat planti rein olsem na ol bosman luksave olsem em i no isi long lukautim ol rot. Nau i no gat kain sapot long stretim na lukautim ol rot gut olgeta taim olsem hevi stap yet. Na tu luksave Oro provins i bin putim moni (2001) long lukautim ol rot tasol i no karim kaikai olsem na i mas i gat sampela tok stret wantaim kontrak long lukautim rot i mas stap⁴⁴. Ol bosman i bin luksave long dispela na putim moni (Road Maintenance Trust Fund) long lukautim ol rot⁴⁵. Ol husat usim rot bai baim hap moni long lukautim rot. Na tu ol i bin kirapim wanpela hap lain save man tru long lukautim rot ol kolim Road Engineering Unit ananit long dispela projek usat go pas long lukautim ol rot. Ol bosman bilip olsem dispela lain bai lukautim ol rot gut stret.
38. Ol bosman tok olsem ol takis moni bilong PNG i no baim 150 kilomita rot ol i no pinisim ananit long projek bilong Oro. Olsem na bai ol i no baim gen long pinisim rot projek⁴⁶. Ol bosman long projek itok, ol usim pinis 79(%) pesen long moni ol makim long autsait long taun na 2(%) pesen long bikpela haiwei. Na tu sampela rot ananit long Oro projek ol AusAID i bin halivim. Na 105 kilomita rot stap yet we PNGSDP bai wokim gen 75 kilomita (nogat dinau long dispela rot) na IDA moni bai wokim narapela 30 kilomita.
39. Ol Bosman tok PAD luksave long OPIC i mas mekim moa long strongim wok na i gat moni stap ananit long dispela projek. OPIC bai painim wanpela saveman long wok klostu wantaim ol liklik oil fama long halivim ol long mekim gut bisnis long oil pam. Na tu aim ol liklik bisnis long oil fama kamap gut, na sapotim OPIC long lukautim ol rot⁴⁷, halivim gut na gutpela sevis, na bai halivim long oil pam iken karim moa yet. Dispela bai halivim takis moni bilong strongim wok bilong OPIC⁴⁸.
40. Ol bosman tok olsem OPIC i nogat wanpela polosi long sapotim or daunim ol wokman usat planim nupela oil pam long nupela blok. Projek i no gat wanpela lo kain olsem long ol wokman olsem. Long tingting blong ol bosman, ol wok save karim kaikai em wok bilong OPIC long kamap long mak ol fama yet i bin putim. Sid bilong oil pam mas planim long gumi wanpela yia pastaim na bihain planim long graun.
41. **Tok long Bus:** Kain Bagarap long Graun na Bus. Ol bosman tok olsem wok skelim i bin kamap long ples projek i stap long en na long Port Moresby long skelim na glasim graun na bus. Ol liklik bisnis man Ol liklik oil pam bisnis, wantaim ol grup long ples wantaim lokol gavman ol i bin mekim toksave pinis⁴⁹. Tasol ol bosman toksave ol wok ol i nap mekim long inapim OP 4.01 ol i no wokim gut. Ol i nap totok wantaim ol husat i mas tok save ol mekim long maus tasol, na moa wok long lukautim bus na graun bai kamap long taim bilong projek.

⁴⁴ Management Response, p. 34

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ Management Response, p. 35

⁴⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁸ Management Response, footnote 62, p.35.

⁴⁹ Management Response, p. 28.

42. Ol bosman wanbel olsem ol i no givim planti toksave insait long EA long aumas wara ol i mas putim taim ol mikisim wara wantaim pipia bilong oil pam⁵⁰. Na tu bai ol was gut long miling kompani ISO14001 na RSPO (Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil) so ol noken puttim planti pipia na kapsaitim i go long wara na graun⁵¹. Ol bosman tokaut olsem ISO14001 na RSPO em wanpela bikpela lo long Wol isave lukautim ol bus na graun gut. Dispela lo save wok gut na toktok gut wantaim ol pipol, ol NGOs, ol lain go pas long lukautim bus na graun na ol arapela lain blong mekim na kamapim gut oil pam⁵². Ol EA, EMP na ESMF luksave long sampela we oil pam projek bai bagarapim bus na graun olsem na ol luksave long tok i kam long Oil Pam projek long wok hat long daunim dispela hevi. Ol bosman long projek wanbel long olsem ol i nap long lukluk gut na skelim gut kain hevi bai kam taim wok long mil i kamap bikpela. Ol tok stret long asua bilong projek olsem ol i no bihainim wanpela hap bilong dispela sefgad polisi WB OP/BP 4.01⁵³.
43. Long lukautim gut ol bus, ol bosman bilip olsem dispela projek i gat gutpela plen long noken daunim bus ol pipol save kisim halivim long en⁵⁴. Na tu ol tok plen blong ol i no karamapim ol bus i gat kainkain samting long bus i stap. Tu ol tok, ol i bin skelim pinis tupela hap, wanpela hap bilong bus tasol na narapela hap we ol abus na ol arapela gutpela samting bilong bus i stap⁵⁵. Ol i no inap mekim wanpela samting long bagarapim dispela tupela hap. Na tu ol OPIC wokman luksave gut long HCVF na projek bai makim tripela 3 wokman husat save gut long lukautim graun na bus na trenim ol gut long lukluk na was gut long bus na graun. Ol bosman tok stret olsem ol i no mekim asua long skelim gut ol bus na abrusim BP4.36 long lain 4 long BP 4.36. Dispela hap toktok long ol bus i gat asua stap we man i no lukautim gut. Long pinisim tok, kompani bai bihainim gut lo bilong Envairomen na Forestri sapos nogat wanpela lo long lukautim oil pam⁵⁶.
44. Ol bosman luksave olsem sampela asua stap long skelim ol wokman insait long OPIC namel long ol wokman na ol bosman long projek bai stretim dispela hevi.
45. **Bekim bilong bosman na wok bilong ol.** Ol bosman bilip olsem ol mekim gut long bihainim polisi na stretpela pasin long bihainim bikpela tingting bilong insait long dispela projek⁵⁷. Ol tok stret olsem ol i no abrusim polisi bilong Wol Benk⁵⁸. Tasol Wol Benk luksave long sampela hap hevi we ol bai stretim pastaim.
- (i) Tok klia olsem mipela i no tanim dispela ol tok i go tok pisin, olsem na Wol Benk bai askim Gavaman long PNG tanim ol toksave i go long Tok Pisin na OPIC by tilim i go long ol lain insait we projek i stap. Na tu OPIC bai toksave long redio ol bikpela tok blong dispela projek long ol lain husat save lukautim liklik oil pam bisnis man. Bai bung wantaim gavman na toktok long tanim ol bikpela tok insait long projek na Wol Benk bai halivim ol lain husat save dinau (Gavaman long PNG) long bai kisim tok insait long tok pisin long Julai 1 2010.

⁵⁰ Management Response, p. 36.

⁵¹ Ibid.

⁵² Management Response, p. 7

⁵³ Ibid.

⁵⁴ Ibid.

⁵⁵ Management Response, p. 37

⁵⁶ Management Response, p. 38

⁵⁷ Management Response, p. 39.

⁵⁸ Management Response, p. 40.

- (ii) Ol bosman luksave olsem ripot bilong olgeta toksave long skelim sindaun bilong pipol bipo long projek i kamap i no bin mekim gut na kilia tumas.
 - (iii) Ol bosman wanbel olsem i no planti tok stap insait long EA long amass wata ol usim long mikisim wantaim pipia blong oil pam. Bai ol skelim na luksave gen sapos oil pam bisnis kamap bikpela na pipia blong oil pam tu kamap bikpela na bagarapim graun.
46. Ol bosman bai mekim sampela wok lukluk i go insait long mekim gut ol dispela sampting:
- (i) Ol bosman bai stretim sampela tok i no stret namel long PIM na EMP na bihaim toktok wantaim OPIC long stretim ol gut.
 - (ii) Luksave na bihainim gut long lukautim graun na ol arapela samting na ol bosman long projek bai toktok wantaim OPIC wantaim ol lain go pas long lukautim bus na graun bai sainim ol pepa bilong tok orait long planim oil pam, long ol Liklik blok (VOP).
 - (iii) I mas toktok wantaim OPIC long strongim wokbung long olgeta bikpela wok insait long projek long taim wok go het na tu taim hap komponen 2 long projek.
 - (iv) Ol bosman bai halivim OPIC long wokim gut RMTF bilong kisim tingting blong olgeta long projek iken stap longpela taim: (a) Long lukluk long we bilong girapim moni bilong lukautim ol rot, bihain long taim Projek bin stretim (RTMFs) olgeta lain bai stap na toktok na oraitim pe bilong wan wan; (b) Wok long kisim na skelim ol tingting bilong maus man long ol liklik oil pam bisnis man blong tingim gen FEB long skelim prais bai wok wantaim OPIC na ol Miling kompani; (c) Bai lukluk gen long we bilong stretim gen rot, lukautim gut ol bus na graun, na tu lukluk gen dispela senisim ples long sidnaun sapos i gat nid long en. Dispela lukluk gen bai kamap bilong wanem IDA bai givim dinau long gavman long PNG long pinisim ol rot wok ol i no pinisim yet we PNGSDP statim pastaim; (d) Bai i gat rot long skelim gutpela sindaun and lukautim bus na graun (e) Lukluk gut sapos sampela hevi kamap insait long ples projek stap long en;

E. ELIGIBILITY. OL LAIN I RAITIM PAS I GAT RAIT O NOGAT

47. Komiti bai skelim na sekim ol kain askim long projek stretpela na bihainim tok stap pinis long tok orait long 1993 na tok klia long 1999⁵⁹. Na tu komiti bai lukluk na skelim gut bai ol i nap wok painim aut ol dispela askim.
48. Long dispela wok, komiti i bin lukim gut ol askim i kam na bekim bilong ol bosman long projek. Na tu komiti memba Eimi Watanabe na Sekteri Dilek Barlas wantaim Oporesen Opisa Mishka Zaman i bin kam long Papua New Guinea long Mun Febuari de 16 i go i nap long de 20 long dispela yia (2010). Long dispela taim ol komiti bung wantaim CELCOR, wokman bilong gavman, wokman bilong Wol Benk na wokman bilong Oil Pam projek. Ol Komiti memba i go long Popondetta insait long Oro provins we pipol husat askim ol dispela askim stap long en na bungim ol pipol. Ol Komiti tu bungim ol wokman bilong gavman long Popondetta, wantaim wokman long OPIC na tu mausman

⁵⁹ Conclusions of the Board's Second Review of the Inspection Panel (the "1999 Clarifications"), April 1999.

bilong Popondetta oil pam fama. Ol Komiti hamamas long ol dispela lain long toksave long tingting bilong ol stret.

49. Komiti tok tenkyu long maus man bilong Wol Benk PNG husat meking gut wok na ol wokman long Sydney husat bin kam long Port Moresby long toksave long Komiti long oil pam project.
50. Komiti hamamas olsem dispela Askim inapim mak ol putim long 1993 na hap lain 9 na hap tok klia long 1999.
51. Taim ol raun, Komiti luksave olsem ol lain go pas long askim ol tru tru lain insait long kontrak we ol i mas askim long ol Komiti bilong skelim i ken mekim wok bilong ol. Olsem n Ol dispela lain Askim mekim gut hap (a) na lain (paragraph) 9.
52. Komiti tokaut klia long ol Askim blong ol people mekim strongpela tok olsem i gat bikpela asua Benk i mekim long kain pasin na we bilong wok ol mekim bai i nap long bagarapim ol ananit long hap lain 9 (b).
53. Ol Lain Askim tok strong olsem pasin na we projek wok bai bagarapim gutpela sindaun na laip bilong ol taim oil pam bisnis kamap bikpela. Oil pam projek bai pasin ol arapela we long pulim moni na lukautim ol yet na tu ol save olsem oil pam i no inap halivim ol long lukautim ol yet na halivim gutpela sindaun bilong ol. Ol husat Askim tok strong olsem oil pam bisnis arere long rot ananit long projek bai bagarapim ol wara na bus. Na tu moni bilong lukautim rot (RMTF) bai mekim ol liklik oil pam bisnis lain bai baim takis long strettim rot. Dispela pasin bilong kisim takis bai pulim moa moni long ol pipol na mekim ol rabis man tru, na ol rot bai bagarap gen.
54. Ol Komiti toksave olsem Wol Benk luksave long wari bilong ol husat Askim na skelim na glasim gut wok bilong projek. Ol lain husat Askim i bin rait i go long Wol Benk na bung wantaim ol wokman bilong Wol Benk planti taim liklik bipo long ol askim Wol Benk long skelim projek. Tasol, Ol lain askim tok klia olsem ol i no hamamas long toksave long namba tu skelim Wol Benk i bin mekim (ref 1999 Tok Klia). Komiti hamamas olsem dispela Askim ol karim i go long Ol bosman long projek tasol long ai bilong ol lain Askim, bosman long dispela projek i no bekim tok blong ol hariap na behainim polisi bilong Wol Benk. Na tu Askim bihainim ol tok stap long lain 9(c).
55. Komiti luksave olsem ol lain "Askim" i no toktok long baim samting long inapim hap 9(d).
56. Rot long kisim dinau bai pas long 31 Disemba 2012. Long taim dispela Askim pas i kam, 2.6 pesen (%) dinau ol i bin givin pinis. Olsem na dispela Askim inapim hap tok stap long lain 9 (e). Olsem na dispela hap long givin dinau i no pas olsem na nogat planti dinau i pinis.
57. Moa yet, Komiti i no tok orait or nogat long dispela Askim bipo. Olsem na Askim inapim lain 9(f).

F. OL LUKSAVE

58. Long stat long dispela projek, Komiti luksave olsem dispela projek em bikpela na kirapim planti wok long halivim komuniti sanap strong. Komiti luksave long gutpela bilong Oil Pam long halivim PNG pulim planti moni ikam insait long kantri. Tasol Komiti luksave long bikpela tok insait long dispela Askim. Bikpela askim kamap long we oil pam mekim long sindaun bilong ol liklik oil pam bisnis man. Komiti skelim gut bekim ol bosman long oil pam i bin mekim na ol arapela tok long dispela askim. Dispela askim go bek long we oil pam kirap na we Wol Benk i bin halivim stat long 1969. Komiti hamamas long ol bosman we ol luksave long sampela hevi na painim we long oratim ol dispela hevi.
59. Tok long Kamap Rabis man: Long taim Komiti raunim Popondetta, ol bung wantaim planti lain husat lukautim oil pam⁶⁰ insait long blok, ol baim graun na sindaun wantaim as ples. Olgeta lukautim oil pam 30 o 35 yia tasol ol lain tokim Komiti olsem oil pam i no halivim gut sindaun bilong ol. Ol Komiti lukluk raun long ples ol dispela lain sindaun na lukim olsem sindaun bilong ol i no gut tumas. Haus bilong ol wokim long kunai na samting bilong bus na nogat klin wara long dring. Komiti lukim planti lain stap long wanpela haus. Planti lain insait long hauslain kisim halivim long liklik oil pam blok tasol bikos ol stap long blok longpela taim na namba long femili kamap bikpela na nogat moa graun long wokim nupela haus na gaden. Olsem na planti hevi wok long kam insait long femili.
60. Olgeta husat lukautim liklik oil pam long block sindaun wantaim Komiti na autim bel hevi bilong takis ol baim long (FFB). Ol tokim Komiti olsem takis wantaim bekim moni long dinau ol kisim long benk long kirapim bisnis ol rausim long fortnait pe. Taim ol rausim ol dispela kain moni long fortnait pe, ol i gat liklik moni long kaikai na lukautim femili. Sampela soim hap pepa long ol Komiti memba iken lukim gut na ol i no giaman. Ol lain toksave olsem i no gat narapela rot long pulim moni olsem na ol imas wok bung wantaim ol Miling Kompani. Na tu ol nogat pawa long tokim papa bilong mil long apim prais o senisim (FFB) prais long oil pam. Ol liklik oil pam lain tok olsem ol papa long bikpela oil pam wantaim ol Miling kompani save making prais na putim takis long laik bilong ol. Na tu ol lain i no save kisim halivim long takis ol save baim. Ol tokim Komiti olsem ol bai no nap planim moa oil pam. Nau ol laik planim narapela samting long lukatim ol yet. Ol i no planim narapela samting na rausim oil pam bikos ol sot long moni long statim narapela projek long pulim moni. Na tu i no gat saveman long halivim ol long mekim narapela bisnis.
61. Insait long dispela taim Komiti i go ol bung wantaim ol meri husat go pas long Mama Lus Fruit Scheme (MLFS). Dispela wok blong ol mama long kisim ol lus oil pam long rot i gutpela long ol mama long kisim moni. Taim Mama Lus Frut Scheme i kirap, ol i no putim takis. Tasol long yia 2002 wanpela senis i bin ikam we ol putim takis long FFB taim ol mil baim lus oil pam long ol mama. Ol mama tokim Komiti olsem moni ol kisim halivim ol long baim skul fi, kaikai, na ol narapela samting long haus. Ol meri tokim Komiti olsem ol i no hamamas na tingting “sot” taim ol harim olsem bai ol putim takis moa yet antap long takis ol baim nau (RMTF).

⁶⁰ The Panel tried to meet, courtesy OPIC, with smallholders that were not signatories to the Request; however this meeting could not be held.

62. Ol pipol long komuniti Komiti bin bungim tok strong long arapela we long halivim sindaun bilong ol. Ol luksave na laik lukim gutpela we rot na arapela we long kisim moni bai halivim ol. Komponen 2 long Oil Pam projek tok long halivim ol pipol long dispela kain we. Tasol ol pipol tok stret olsem Projek i no sindaun wantaim ol na toktok long kain halivim ol i ken kisim ananit long hap 2.
63. Long bekim, Ol bosman tok olsem oil pam save givim bigpela moni long wok long ol komunities long taun tasol ol pipol wok long baim ol samting long kaikai nau tasol na i no putim moni long lukautim ol yet long bihain. Na tu ol pipol save lukautim ol Wantok na ol i gat kastam na pasin bilong tumbuna long lukautim ol Wantok. Ol pipol stap long oil pam blok i gat planti Wantok na bikpela pikinini wantaim meri pikinini pulap long blok olsem na mekim planti hevi long ol.
64. Ol bosman long bekim tok olsem bai skelim gen we ol save putim prais bilong oil pam bilong ol Liklik fama. Ol putim moni pinis long lukluk gen na bai tingtim gut ol sea bilong liklik oil pam bisnis lain na ol Mils. Ol bosman luksave long Komponen 2 we toktok stap long komuniti stap insait long oil palm bisnis long halivim gutpela sindaun bilong ol pipol we projek stap long en. Na taim bilong visit bilong Komiti, ol bosman tok ol i stat long selektim ol lain bilong lukautim Komponen 2 long Projek.
65. Long taim Komiti i go long Popondetta, ol bung wantaim ol wokman bilong OPIC na bosman bilong POPGA wantaim arapela lain husat save lukautim oil pam. Ol wokman long OPIC soim Komiti wanpela lista moa long pipol husat aplai long kamap nupela liklik oil pam fama (VOP). Dispela soim olsem planti pipol i gat laik long stap insait long oil pam bisnis. POPGA tok long bisnis bilong oil pam i gutpela tumas na halivim gutpela sindaun bilong ol pipol na daunim ol hevi. Ol wokman bilong POPGA tokim Komiti olsem kofi na bulumakau bisnis i no halivim ol tumas tasol oil pam halivim planti lain na pulim bikpela moni.
66. **Tok Long Bus:** Long dispela taim Komiti sindaun wantim ol pipol stap arere long wara klostu long Oil Pam Mil. Ol pipol tokim ol Komiti long posin na nogut bilong oil pam ol save kapsaitim i go long ol wara we ol save usim long waswas na lukaitim ol yet. Ol dispela samting bagarapim ol na kisim sik long skin, fis wok long dai, bagarapin graun na kaikai i no kamap gut, na smel nogut save kamap. Ol pipol autim ol dispela hevi long ol Oil Pam Mil tasol ol i no mekim wanpela samting long daunim ol hevi. I gat lo ol Mils (RSPO) imas bihainim na noken tromoi pipia long wara.
67. Ol bosman long bekim blong ol wanbel olsem ol i no givim planti toksave long pepa ol raitim long wok painimaut long pasin ol save mikisim wara wantaim pipia blong oil pam bipo long ol kapsaitim i go long wara. Bai ol skelim gen bagarap kamap long wara taim ol kapsaitim pipia i go long wara. Ol bosman redi na plen long toktok wantaim Gavman long PNG long dispela wari long Mun Mas long dispela yia (2010).
68. Komiti luksave long tubel stap namel long ol bosman long projek na ol lain husat askim long bagarap kamap long bus. Ol lain askim bung wantaim Komiti long Popondetta na luksave long oil pam bisnis suruk i go insait long bus ol makim long slip nating na bus i bin stap bipo yet. Ol lain Askim wanbel olsem ol wokman long OPIC nogat planti wokman long skelim gut na ol bai sainim pepa nating na larim oil pam bisnis bai go insait brukim nupela bus. Ol tok klia olsem bai ol planim oil pam arere na bai mekim ol pipol long brukim nupela bus long planim kaikai.

69. Long bekim tok, ol bosman luksave olsem projek bai lukaut gut long noken go insait long bus ol i tambuim. Ol bosman tok olsem ol putim pinis bikpela tok lukaut na tambu long daunim bus na planim oil pam. Ol bosman luksave olsem sampela asua stap long skelim wok bilong ol wokman bilong OPIC wantaim ol lain go pass long lukautim bus (environment officers) na lain bilong lukautim graun (lands officers). Bai ol mekim klia wok bilong ol dispela lain.
70. **Mekim Toksave na Wokbung:** Long taim Komiti go bungim, ol komuniti tokim ol olsem ol laik bung na toktok wantaim bipo ol tok orait long projek iken go het. Ol lain long komuniti bilip olsem ol ikem kamap long mak sapos ol projek lain mekim toksave na wokbung wantaim komuniti. Dispela kain pasin i nap halivim mekim gut plen long kisim helipim moni long arapela we long lukautim ol yet. Ol luksave olsem long RMTF, ol rausim moni long Free Fruit Bunch nating na i no tok save long ol. Ol baim bikpela moni long baim trak long karim oil pam na ol i no klia bilong wanem ol imas putim moni gen long RMTF long mil kompani. Tru ol luksave long rot em gutpela samting tasol ol makim hap moni long putim i go insait long RMFT i no gutpela tumas.
71. Long taim Komiti i go lukim ol lain long ples ol i gat wanpela belhevi we wanpela i no go sindaun na toktok wantim ol bipo ol kirapim projek. Ol tok olsem sapos wanpela go sindaun wantaim ol, projek bai i no inap wok olsem nau. Bai ol i nap long tok stret pastaim na bai tingim gut ol arapela we long kisim moni tu. Ol luksave olsem insait long RTMF ol rausim moni ol bringim i kam insait long FFB na ol i no save long dispela. Ol i no amamas na tokaut olsem ol baim bikpela moni long RMTF wankaim olsem ol Mil kompani. Ol luksave olsem rot em gutpela samting long halivim ol hap moni ol baim i no stret. Ol Bosman long projek tok olsem tok i bin stap namel long pipol bipo long projek i kirap olsem na i gat bikpela lain sapatim oil pam bisnis. Ol bosman tok olsem bai ol pinisim mak bilong RMTF insait long bikpela luksave.
72. Komiti skelim na luksave long bikpela wok long bungim olgeta lain and mekim toksave. Dispela em hat wok long bungim planti lain bilong kainkain tokples na planti lain i no save rit na rait. Na tu sampela liklik oil pam bisnis man bilip olsem POPGA i no makim ol gut na tokaut gut long makim ol bung.
73. **Projek Stap Longpela:** Ol liklik oil pam bisnis man wari na autim tingting bilong ol long Komiti. Ol tingting planti loF projek bai stap longpela taim o nogat. Provinsel gavman nogat moni long putim hap bilong ol insait long RMTF long stretim rot kwiktaim na olgeta taim. Ol tokaut olsem ol pulim takis moni long stretim rot tasol i no i nap mekim olsem longpela taim. Na tu dispela projek i no inap stap longpela taim bikos OPIC i no strong tumas long halivim gut. Ol tokaut olsem ol wokman bilong OPIC i no mekim gut wok bilong ol. Ol wok wokman mekim i no nupela, ol lain long ples save pinis. Ol tok moa olsem wok bilong OPIC em I nogut na Mil kompani savi wokim dispela kain halivim long ol lilik oil pam bisnis man.
74. Long bekim, ol bosman tok olsem ol save putim moni long strongim wok bilong OPIC. Na tu long bihainim tok ol mekim antap, bai ol mak gut long RMTF blong mekim strong projek long stap longpela taim.

75. Komiti i no bilong skelim wok na bai i no inap ripotim Wol Benk long kain wok nogut ol mekim we ol i no bihainim polisi bilong em long hap long mak⁶¹. Komiti long dispela taim noken pasim tingting na mekim wanpela tok ariap long kain tok ol mekim antap long dispela Projek.
76. Ol bosman long Wol Benk bekim tok olsem ol pasin tok pinis long noken putim moni long nupela oil pam projek long Novemba 2009. Tasol tok ya i no pasim dispela Projek bikos Projek i no nupela. Na mak (design) bilong dispela Projek luksave pinis long sindaun bilong pipol, na bus. Ol bosman long Wol Benk mekim klia olsem bai ol skelim ol nupela projek long stretim gut long mekim nupela projek wok gut.
77. Ol dispela tok stap antap luksave strongpela tok wantaim bel hevi bilong ol liklik lain husat lukautim oil pam we dispela projek wok long senisim planti samting long en. Komiti luksave long bikpela hevi na planti askim na asua stap long bihainim stretpela rot long mekim wok. Na tu ol luksave long tubel stap namel long bosman blong projek na ol lain lukautim liklik oil pam blok. Wanpela we long stretim dispela hevi bai ol mas mekim wanpela wok painimaut na skelim we stap hevi.

G. PINISIM TOK

78. Ol lain askim na ol kain askim fit long tok ol pasim long kamapim wanpela Komiti long skelim kain olsem long 1999.
79. Komiti luksave long tok pait na kainkan tingting long mak bilong projek. Long luksave gut sapos projek bihainim stret mak o abrusim mak, Komiti i mas skelim olgeta mak projek na painimaut projek i bin bihainim o nogat. Dispela i ken kamap sapos wanpela wok panimaut i kamap.
80. Long luksave kainkain tok stap, Komiti strongim tok olsem i mas i gat wanpela wok painimaut long lukluk long planti samting ol askim. Komiti bai mekim wanpela ripot long wok ol bosman i bin mekim. Dispela ripot bai lukluk long painimaut long luksave projek bihainim stret polosi na stretim hevi bilong ol askim o nogat.

⁶¹ 1999 Clarifications to Panel Resoltuion, Paragraph 7. This paragraph further provides that “any definitive assessment of a serious failure of the Bank that has caused material adverse effect will be done after the Panel has completed its investigation.”