

# Complaint (Request for Inspection) Form

**To:**  
**The Chair, Inspection Panel**  
**The World Bank Accountability Mechanism, MSN: MC 10-1007, 1818 H St., NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA. Fax: +1(202)-522-0916. Email: [ipanel@worldbank.org](mailto:ipanel@worldbank.org)**

*(Please answer the questions below as best as you can. Once the form is submitted, we will contact you to collect any additional necessary information.)*

## Section 1: Complaint

1. What harm do you believe the World Bank-financed project caused or is likely to cause to you or your community? Please describe in as much detail as possible.

The World Bank project is causing us harm. We are the households that are directly affected by “Ngoc Hiep Resettlement Area Infrastructure Construction Project”, which is part of component 3 of the project “Sustainable environment in coastal cities” for short. CCSEP. Our situation was extremely difficult, managed, borrowed money from many places to build a house to cover the sun and rain. It is known that Ngoc Hiep resettlement area project is a loan project of the World Bank. The policy of the project is for social security purposes, creating favorable conditions for households affected by the project to stabilize their lives and have better or at least equal living conditions than before. affected by the project. We very much agree with the above policy, so we have cooperated in the inventory of assets, supporting the project to be completed soon.

We have a house, land and are living in the place where the land is acquired before the cut-off date is the date of issuance of the notice of land acquisition 1/9/2016. We consider that we are eligible for on-site resettlement according to regulations, but the Project Management Board gave various reasons for us not to be granted resettlement land. There are a number of households that have been eligible for resettlement grant, the list has been publicly posted and the lottery has been held to select the land plot, but now under the new plan, they are not allowed to resettle. The project had a decision on land acquisition and a decision approving the compensation, support and resettlement plan in 2016 but the project management board based it on Decision No. 10/2021/QD-UBND dated August 26, 2021 of Khanh Hoa Provincial People's Committee to make compensation, support and resettlement plans is unreasonable. Conditions for land allocation for resettlement comply with Decision No. 10/2021/QD-UBND dated August 26, 2021 of Khanh Hoa Provincial People's Committee, so what Decision does the price of resettlement land follow? The price of resettlement land for ineligible cases is calculated by a coefficient of 1.05 or 1.5 compared to the price of eligible resettlement land? The current status of our land is residential land, land for perennial crops, but the Project Management Board based on the origin of land from before 1994, which is field land and annual crop land, to apply a compensation price of 400,000 VND to 600,000 VND/m<sup>2</sup> is too unreasonable. With this compensation price, the households who lost their land cannot afford to buy land at the current market price. Most of the households whose land was acquired did not agree with this compensation price, did not voluntarily allocate land, some households were forced to acquire land. Households eligible for resettlement grant do not have enough money to buy resettlement rates, even less money to build houses to stabilize their lives. The project has only one, but sometimes the policy of applying the resettlement policy framework of the "sustainable environmental project in coastal cities" signed with the World Bank, sometimes according to Decision No. No. 29/2014/QD-UBND dated December 21, 2014, sometimes applying the Decision No. 10/2021/QD-UBND dated August 26, 2021 of the People's Committee of Khanh Hoa province to make a compensation plan. Does project management still apply Decisions? Ngoc Hiep Resettlement Project recovers houses and land that are not part of the resettlement land fund of households who are producing and living stably for decades in the locality, expelling us from the locality to make a land fund. Provision for resettlement for households affected by other projects is extremely unreasonable.

However, after reviewing the Compensation, Support and Resettlement Plan of the project publicly listed at the People's Committee of Ngoc Hiep Ward and the Development Project Management Board of Khanh Hoa Province, we completely disagree with the compensation package and unfair treatment with this method. We complained to the World Bank and the Inspection Panel about the above irregularities in the Project. After our complaint about unfair compensations in the resettlement policies, in February 2023, the World Bank project excluded our houses from resettlement and promised us that we will get a written note that our land and houses will not be used by the Bank or any other project. After engaging since 2016, the Project excluded our land from the project. Until today, now we have not received the assurance that our lands will be safe and not used for the Project. In the report of notice of Non-Registration of The inspection panel, it showed that Khanh Hoa provincial will not acquire our land under the World Bank Project, and we will no longer "considered as project affected household". It means our land will not be acquired for any reasons, for any project in the future. And World Bank also had the confirmed in writing of Khanh Hoa provincial about this matter.

But actually, at the meeting with Project manager unit, they only mention that "STOP site clearance" our land and cancel the compensated counting sheet that they issued before, not mention about cancel the Decision of land acquisition for Ngoc Hiep project. And at the meeting with Khanh Hoa manager on 24 March, the manager didn't make sure that our land will not be acquired. We don't know what will be going on with our land. The Ngoc Hiep project has been started from 2016 and it's still affected to us up to now. During the time for project, We could not do anything with our land. We could not apply for land certificate, could not repair or build house, could not sell or for rent....

On 25 of March. We also have included two letters of affected people and consider as part of the group of complainants. Their living conditions are very difficult. They are single mom like me and they have no house, there no stable job. They only have a small land is the biggest of their property. Beside two persons, there are a lot of affected people who have the same situation. We will have no house to live in if our land will be acquired for Ngoc Hiep resettlement because the compensate package did not comply The World Bank's policy framework.

On September 10, 2014 one community member built a house for her mother and daughter to have a place to live, just built it, on October 3, 2014, the Ward People's Committee decided to dismantle their house and tear it down. The wall fell down, I begged and begged but was still forced, her mother and herself had to stay here and there. Until 2016, the Ward People's Committee and the Project Board announced that this area was planned to be the Ngoc Hiep resettlement area and offered a compensation price of 54 million. But they didn't accept it because the money was too little for the land when I bought it and the house was demolished. They have applied for consideration of the City People's Committee and the Provincial People's Committee according to her wish to grant her 1 resettlement lot, but the departments answered the application that she is not eligible to receive resettlement and until now, she have not received the compensation yet. Now she is asking the World Bank to help, because their land is within 5 hectares and is irrevocable, they hope that their land will be returned to them and allow them to build a house and make a red book on the land. above land for mother and daughter to live stably.

Another community member is a single mother raising a disabled daughter (who is blind, both hands and feet have no fingers and nerves). She used to own land plot number [REDACTED] sheet number [REDACTED] extracted from cadastral measurements of land area No [REDACTED] scale 1/500 of Ngoc Hiep Ward, established on September 27, 2016 by the Technical Center for Natural Resources and Environment. and certified by the Department of Natural Resources and Environment on November 21, 2016, corresponding to a part of land plot number [REDACTED] cadastral map sheet number [REDACTED] Ngoc Hiep ward, Nha Trang city, Khanh Hoa province. She was forced to recover the above 145m<sup>2</sup> land, although she wrote a petition and presented the situation and asked to be considered for support, she was still coerced and compensated for more than 90 million VND. Although they disagree. They still have to receive money to support their children, and borrow money to continue living. She is currently staying with her biological mother's house to live and raise my children. Apart from the land property that was coerced, her son and herself have no other assets. She write here with her honest



feelings. She still hopes that the Project team will consider and support her so that her mother and she can have a less difficult and miserable life in the future.

There are many other community members who are suffering similar situations.

On 11 of May, the World Bank informed us that they are working with the Project Management Unit and Khanh Hoa Provincial People's Committee to issue a final decision to cancel the acquisition of land in the area of 5 hectares in Ngoc Hiep Resettlement area, This decision will be issued by June 30, 2023. It will remove existing project-related restrictions on our property and we will have the authority to build or repair house according to local regulations.

We are very pleased to receive this information, we trust the follow up of the World Bank so we wait patiently until June 30, 2023.

On June 30, the World Bank again announced that "The World Bank has followed up with the local authorities to no longer acquire 5 hectares for the purposes of the Project. The deadline has been agreed between the provincial government and the Bank is June 30, 2023...However, there are some delays in administrative procedures..., the Bank will continue to monitor this agreement and its representatives. The bank's senior staff will come to Nha Trang to meet with the provincial leaders to agree not to delay any further.

But we found on June 27, Khanh Hoa Provincial People's Committee issued an official document No. 6312/UBND-XDND on adjusting the infrastructure construction project of Ngoc Hiep resettlement area in the direction of diverging the project into 02 phase (phase 1 makes investment on the recovered land, implementation time is 2016 in 2024; phase 2 makes investment on unrecovered land, implementation time is after 2024).

There was a conflict between the update by the World Bank on June 30 and the decision No. 6312/UBND-XDND dated June 27 of the People's Committee of Khanh Hoa province.

We think Khanh Hoa managers will force us to hand over our land to project after CCSEP finish.

We would request the inspection panel to investigate our complaint.

2. What is the name of the World Bank project? (If known)

Vietnam Coastal Cities Sustainable Environment Project (P156143)

3. Where is the World Bank project located? (Please include country name)

Nha Trang city, Vietnam

4. Do you live in the project area?

Yes.

5. Have your concerns previously been reported to the World Bank? If yes, please provide the details about those communications and explain why you are not satisfied with the Bank's response.

Yes. We sent complaint to World Bank in December 2022. We wrote to Inspection Panel at the same time. Inspection Panel did not register as Bank did not have opportunity to respond. Bank excluded our land from the project and promised that our land will not be used by the project.

On March 25, 2023, we wrote two additional community member complaint to GRS (Case Number FY23-GRS-1743, Vietnam CCSEP Project (P156143))

On July 1, 2023, we wrote a concern to GRS (Case Number FY23-GRS-1743, Vietnam CCSEP Project (P156143)) about the decision No. 6312/UBND-XDND dated June 27 of the People's Committee of Khanh Hoa province.

On 17 Feb 2023 The PMU informed that the remaining five hecta would not be acquired for the project . Our land will no longer be handed over to the project but we have not received the Decision to cancel land acquisition for 5 hecta.

At the meeting with the PMU on 23 Feb 2023, They informed us the same information. We told them our concerns and we need Khanh Hoa people's provincial committee to confirm and issue the Decision so that We can request for a resident land license then we can repair or build the house on land. We still have not received their reply.

On 20 March 2023, We sent the second complaint to the World bank project team, Khanh Hoa people's province, Nha Trang people's province and PMU.

On 24 March 2023, We had a meeting with them. At the meeting, We asked them if our land was acquired, please issue the Decision and allow us to repair or build a house because our house has been degraded for the last 7 years. But The managers said that in a short time our land will not be acquired. PMU has to submit the solution to Khanh Hoa chairman before 30 June 2023 so that he can decide whether or not to acquire our land. And he said that during this time, We are not allowed to repair or build the house because that area is agricultural land.

In fact, The land was agricultural land based on the original land before 1994. After 1994, the owner divided many small lots (100-200m2) and sold them to us to build a house. It is not suitable for producing agricultural products. We have houses on it before the cut off date and we need to repair or build a house to live in. If we are not affected by the Ngoc Hiep resettlement project, we can submit for a resident land according to Vietnam land law.

We are concerned that our land will be acquired, maybe be forced to hand over to the project in the future. Because in the past, there were some cases of force to hand over their empty land to the project that I mentioned before.

On August 15, 2023, we sent the third complaint of community to GRS, The World Bank project team, Khanh Hoa Chairmain, Nha Trang committee and PMU.

We need the Decision of Khanh Hoa people's provincial committee to cancel the land acquisition according to the issue on 17 Feb 2023 and informed on 24 Feb 2023 by PMU. We need The World bank has respond if our land will be acquired for any reason before or after CCSEP finish.

6. If known, please list the World Bank's operational policies procedures you believe have not been followed.

World Bank Involuntary Resettlement Policy

7. Do you expect any form of retaliation or threats for filing this complaint?

8. In addition to receiving information about the Compliance investigation process, would you also like to receive information about the option of dispute resolution?

yes.

## Section 2: Contact Information

9. Are you complainants or a representative of complainants\*?  
Complainants:  Representing a complainant or community:  Other:  (Please explain)

10. Would you like your name and contact details to be kept confidential? (We will not disclose your identities to anyone without your prior consent.) Yes  No

11. Complainants' or representatives' names (minimum two names and signatures are required):

No	Complainants' Name	Phone	Address
1			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
2			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
3			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
4			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
5			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
6			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
7			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
8			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
9			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
10			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
11			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
12			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
13			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
14			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
15			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
16			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
17			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
18			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
19			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
20			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
21			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
22			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
23			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
24			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
25			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
26			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
27			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
28			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
29			Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang

30				Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang
31				Ngoc Hiep, Nha Trang

12. By completing and submitting this form, we authorize the Inspection Panel to investigate the issues as described in this form

**CHỮ KÝ CÁC HỘ DÂN KHIÊU NẠI**

STT	Họ và tên	Số điện thoại	Chữ ký
1)			
2)			
3)			
4)			
5			
6			
7			
8			
9.			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19.			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
28			
28			





*Your personal data will only be used and disclosed for the purpose for which it was collected in accordance with the WBG Data Privacy Policy. Inspection Panel will not disclose information provided by complainants that may reveal their identity outside of responsible World Bank units without their consent.*

NOTES:

- *\*If you are a representative of complainants, we will need a letter from the complainants authorizing you to represent them.*
- *Please attach supporting documents, if available.*
- *If you have any difficulty in completing the form, please contact the World Bank Accountability Mechanism at Email: [ipanel@worldbank.org](mailto:ipanel@worldbank.org) or by phone: +1-202-458-5200.*