International Bank for Reconstruction and Development International Development Association

FIRST PROGRESS REPORT

ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF MANAGEMENT'S ACTION PLAN IN RESPONSE TO THE

INSPECTION PANEL INVESTIGATION REPORT (INSP/R2018-0002) ON THE DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF CONGO

SECOND ADDITIONAL FINANCING FOR THE HIGH-PRIORITY ROADS

REOPENING AND MAINTENANCE PROJECT (P153836)

FIRST PROGRESS REPORT

IMPLEMENTATION OF MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN

CONTENTS

Abbri	EVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	. ii
Execu	jtive Summary	iii
I.	INTRODUCTION	. 1
II.	MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN	. 2
III.	PROGRESS OF MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN IMPLEMENTATION	. 6
IV.	NEXT STEPS	15

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ACE Agence Congolaise de l'Environnement (Congolese

Environmental Agency)

AF Additional Financing

BEGES Bureau d'Etudes pour la Gestion Environnementale et Sociale

(Firm contracted for the management of the environment and

social component as safeguards supervisor)

BP Bank Procedures

DRC Democratic Republic of Congo
EHS Environmental, Health and Safety
ESF Environmental and Social Framework

ESIA Environmental and Social Impact Assessment ESMP Environmental and Social Management Plan

GBV Gender-based Violence

GRM Project-level Grievance Redress Mechanism IDA International Development Association

MONUSCO United Nations Organization Stabilization Mission in the DRC

MPW Ministry of Public Works NGO Nongovernmental organization

OP Operational Policy

PIU Project Implementation Unit

ProRoutes High-Priority Roads Reopening and Maintenance Project

RAP Resettlement Action Plan

RARIP Réseau d'Analystes des relations Internationales pour la Paix

dans la Région des Grands Lacs (Network of International

Relations Analysts for Peace in the Great Lakes Region, NGO)

RN <u>Route nationale</u> (National road) UNFPA United Nations Population Fund

Currency Unit (as of March 25, 2019) Congolese Franc

1 CDF = 0.00062 US\$ 1 US\$ = 1,613 CDF

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- i. On August 27, 2018, Management submitted its Report and Recommendation,¹ including a detailed Management Action Plan (MAP), in response to the Inspection Panel's Investigation Report No. 124033-ZR on the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) Second Additional Financing for the High-Priority Roads Reopening and Maintenance (ProRoutes) Project (P153836). On September 7, 2018, the Bank's Board of Executive Directors (the Board) considered both reports and approved the MAP.
- ii. This is the first Progress Report to the Board on the implementation of the MAP, covering activities and information available for the period September 7, 2018 to March 15, 2019.
- iii. *For background:* The ProRoutes Project aims to "re-establish lasting road access between provincial capitals, districts and territories in the Project implementation area in a way that is sustainable for the natural environment." ProRoutes is supported by a total IDA amount of US\$238 million. This includes an IDA grant of US\$50 million equivalent approved by the Board on March 18, 2008. A first Additional Financing (AF1) in the amount of US\$63.3 million equivalent was approved in June 2011 to scale up ProRoutes activities. On February 18, 2016, a second Additional Financing (AF2) in the amount of US\$125 million equivalent was approved to support further ProRoutes activities. AF2, or "the Project," has been the subject of the Request for Inspection and subsequent investigation and reports of the Panel and Management. On November 27, 2017, the Bank suspended its disbursements for all road works financed under the Project due to the Borrower's noncompliance with its obligations to carry out the Project in conformity with appropriate environmental and social standards and practices, including management of gender-based violence (GBV), and to minimize the risk of additional harm to Project-affected people.
- iv. In its Report and Recommendation in response to the Inspection Panel Investigation Report, Management committed to a detailed set of actions at the local, provincial and national levels to address the impacts suffered by project communities and to improve the capacity of all the actors involved in the supervision of the Project, including the supervision engineers, the provincial authorities, the specialized nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) involved in the management of GBV risks, the Government of DRC and the Bank to better manage the types of issues that arose under the Project.
- v. *MAP implementation summary:* Since the MAP was approved in September 2018, significant progress has been made in implementing its 28 actions: 10 actions have been completed, 16 actions are on track and will be monitored until the Project closes, 1 is pending the resumption of works on National Road 2 (RN2),² and 1 action is not applicable at this point.³ Considering the progress achieved in implementing the MAP and other measures agreed with the Government of DRC, Management lifted the partial suspension of disbursements under the Project

¹ "Management Report and Recommendation in Response to the Inspection Panel Investigation Report".

² This action involves the hiring of 20 workers from the community by the RN2 Contractor.

³ This action relates to the support to be provided to GBV survivors that would not have been completed by the closing date of the ProRoutes Project. This action is not applicable at this point since the Project closing date has been extended by the Bank until February 29, 2020.

on December 3, 2018.⁴ At that time, the Congolese authorities also had met all the conditions required to end the suspension, both for the Goma-Bukavu road (RN2) and for the other roads financed under ProRoutes. The Project's closing date has been extended by 12 months by the Bank in order to complete road works, as well as social and environmental activities.

vi. Since the lifting of the suspension of IDA disbursements, most of ProRoutes' road works have restarted. One of the ProRoutes' roads, National Road 4 (RN4) linking Beni to Kasindi, is playing a critical role in the Ebola response currently being implemented with Bank support in Northern Kivu. This road is currently the only reliable land access to the city of Beni, the epicenter of the current Ebola epidemy. As of February 20, 2019, the resumption of works on RN2, which connects two important economic hubs in Eastern DRC, Bukavu and Goma, and was the focus of the Inspection Panel's investigation, is imminent but is still pending the completion of a communication plan being implemented by a local NGO (RARIP)⁵ to inform communities of the Contractor's projected workplan and the various available mechanisms to channel possible complaints, including GBV incidents.

vii. Since August 2017 when the Panel informed Management of the complaint, Management has exerted considerable effort in remedying the identified problems that arose as a result of shortcomings in the preparation and supervision of the Project. Management also has supported the Borrower's implementation of agreed actions and measures put in place to remedy and prevent harm to the affected communities. Since the submission of its Management Report and the indepth review of lessons learned that followed, Management has undertaken steps on multiple fronts – both Project-level and system-wide - to address the serious issues noted in the reports of both the Bank and the Panel:

- (i) At the Project level, remedial actions have been implemented on RN2, as well as on other road works financed by the Project.⁶ Since August 2017, twelve Bank missions have traveled to DRC to visit and supervise Project sites, with the most recent one conducted during February 10-15, 2019. Despite challenging security conditions, which at times have prevented travel, all major road works have been visited by a Bank mission.
- (ii) System-wide, Management has sought to improve the management of GBV-risks in all Bank-financed investment projects and to this end, led the preparation of a Good Practice Note (GPN) for staff. The GPN was disseminated to Bank teams as part of the roll-out of the Bank's Environmental and Social Framework (ESF) on October 1, 2018. The GPN provides guidance on appropriate GBV risk mitigation measures based on the level of risk posed by individual operations as well as contextual risk. The GPN has been used in the preparation of all new Bank-financed

iv

⁴ This decision was notified to the Board on December 7, 2018 and to the Congolese authorities on December 10, 2018. The lifting of suspension of IDA disbursements – when conditions were met – was one of the MAP actions.

⁵ This communication plan started to be implemented by RARIP on January 23, 2019 and is scheduled to be completed by end March, 2019.

⁶ In addition to RN2, the Project finances the rehabilitation of four additional roads: RN4, RN6, RN23 and RN27.

⁷ "Good Practice Note for Addressing GBV in Investment Project Financing involving Major Civil Works" (September 2018)

projects in the transport sector in Africa and other regions. Currently, all active Bank operations in the DRC are introducing additional GBV risk mitigation measures following the guidance provided in the GPN. Management also has issued a Good Practice Note on how to handle the use of security personnel in Bank operations.⁸

- viii. *Gender-Based Violence allegations:* In line with the recommendations of the GBV Task Force,⁹ the Bank is implementing a survivor-centric approach under the Project to ensure that affected women and girls receive medical, psychosocial and legal assistance, in accordance with their individual needs and preferences. Management has focused first and foremost on helping all identified survivors, regardless of whether the GBV allegations are linked to the Project or not, subject to the survivor's consent and wishes. To this end, specialized GBV organizations coordinated by the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) have been contracted to monitor the GBV risk on RN2 and other ProRoutes' roads under rehabilitation; to provide a pathway for survivors to safely and confidentially disclose GBV-related complaints if they wish to do so; and to offer the needed services.
- ix. In addition to the specialized GBV organizations, a dedicated and confidential grievance redress mechanism (GBV GRM committees) has been established to review each GBV allegation whenever survivors agree to it. These innovative GBV GRMs have been developed in collaboration with key stakeholders and GBV experts to review allegations and assess whether there is a link to the ProRoutes Project, in line with GBV ethical standards and a survivor-centric approach. Irrespective of whether the incident is linked to ProRoutes, survivors who report incidents are provided with access to the same set of basic services.
- x. Based on the 34 allegations of rape or sexual assault reviewed and closed to date, the GBV GRMs have determined that eight (8) incidents are likely linked to the Project. These eight (8) incidents involve underage girls who have all been offered services by the specialized NGOs contracted by the Project. The remaining 26 allegations reviewed by the GBV GRMs were found either not to be related to ProRoutes or the available evidence is not sufficient to conclude in one way or another. As of March 15, 2019, another 26 alleged incidents of rape or sexual assault are currently under review by the GBV GRMs in addition to the 34 allegations referenced above.
- xi. Beyond the allegations referenced above, 25 adult women reported allegations not involving rape or sexual assault. Of these 25 incidents, the GBV GRMs determined that 13 were likely linked to the Project.
- xii. The Bank has not received any allegation involving an incident that took place since IDA disbursements resumed in December 2018. Only one alleged incident 10 has occurred since all workers were trained in GBV awareness and prevention.

-

⁸ Good Practice Note on Assessing and Managing the Risks and Impacts of the Use of Security Personnel

⁹ The Global Gender-Based Violence Task Force was formed to strengthen the Bank's response to instances of GBV encountered as part of its operations. The Task Force included a range of members from academia, NGOs, foundations, UNICEF, and government.

¹⁰ This GBV incident allegedly took place in June 2018.

xiii. The Project has provided the same level of support to all individuals who reported allegations of rape, sexual assault or other incidents through the specialized GBV organizations as mentioned above. All survivors have been offered a comprehensive package of support by these organizations, without waiting for the GBV GRM review and regardless of whether the incident can be linked to the Project. As of March 15, 2019, all but one survivor had accepted such assistance and received psychosocial support, medical assistance, and/or legal assistance, based on their needs and preferences. While legal assistance has been provided to 18 survivors, only five (5) of them decided to file a complaint in the legal system. The Bank, through the Project Implementation Unit (PIU) and UNFPA, is monitoring the conclusions of these legal proceedings. The ProRoutes Project also has established a mechanism to refer GBV survivors to services made available through the two stand-alone Bank-financed GBV projects that are being implemented in the RN2 area, 11 fostering complementarities of GBV services offered across the Bank's portfolio.

xiv. The GBV GRMs' reviews regarding the linkages of reported incidents with the Project constitute sufficient evidence, when alleged perpetrators are known and are listed in the Contractor's payroll, to refer the allegations to the Project Contractors (with the consent of the survivor). Project Contractors are required by the PIU to report on their subsequent due diligence with respect to the allegations as well as any accountability measures taken in application of the codes of conduct signed by their employees. The Bank has been monitoring the administrative measures taken by Contractors and supervision engineers against alleged perpetrators of incidents that have been reviewed by the GBV GRM. None of the alleged perpetrators involved in either the eight alleged GBV incidents with underage girls or the other 13 alleged incidents linked to the Project remains employed on the Project. To help implement the GBV prevention and risk management measures, the RN2 Contractor has also hired under its own initiative a GBV specialist.

xv. Support to broader GBV activities in the Project area: The specialized GBV organizations financed under ProRoutes and coordinated by UNFPA also have been implementing GBV awareness and prevention activities and providing support to survivors of GBV incidents that are unrelated to ProRoutes but occurred in the Project area. Specifically, 636 survivors (unrelated to ProRoutes) received support and services based on their needs and preference, including 334 in the RN2 area. Stocks of Post-Exposure Prophylaxis (PEP) starter kits¹³ have been supplied by UNFPA to health centers located in the Project area. In addition, more than 150 GBV service providers have been trained by UNFPA, including 45 in the RN2 area. Finally, more than 211,000 people (69,000 in the RN2 area) have benefited from behavioral change communication and other GBV information activities.

xvi. *Other negative impacts:* Management has been monitoring the prevention and mitigation measures associated with other impacts of the Project, including involvement of military personnel and use of force against community members; noncompliance of quarries and borrow pits; and

vi

_

¹¹ The Great Lakes Emergency Sexual and Gender Based Violence and Women's Health project and the DRC – Gender-based Violence Prevention and Response Project.

¹² The Code of Conduct commits employees to respect behavioral standards in the work place and towards community members.

other negative impacts on livelihoods and agricultural land, labor conditions and occupational safety. A specific compliance audit was completed in the field by an independent auditor during October 8-23, 2018, which confirmed that all instances of water supply disruptions had been resolved satisfactorily. Labor inspections of the RN2 worksites have taken place as scheduled. A specific compensation plan has been prepared to resolve the situation of the Tongo-Butale quarry and is being implemented. The compliance of all the Project's quarry and borrow pits with Contractors' safeguards and contractual obligations is closely monitored by the supervision engineers, the PIU and the Bank. All risk mitigation measures and enhanced supervision mechanisms described in the MAP have been put in place and are being periodically reviewed by the PIU, the task team and Management. Since the MAP was approved, the proportion of registered complaints that have been properly handled and concluded has increased from 57 to 97 percent, while the level of complaints has remained the same. The cases have been compensated when found eligible or otherwise been denied. Since November 2017, the Bank has continued to receive a timely and comprehensive monthly report of the status of all complaints received and processed, as agreed with the PIU.

xvii. Since the MAP was approved, institutional strengthening activities to build up the national and provincial capacity to manage safeguards has advanced significantly. Training sessions benefiting the relevant departments in the Ministry of Public Works (MPW), as well as the *Agence Congolaise de l'Environnement* (Congolese Environmental Agency, ACE) were held in November and December 2018 and January 2019. Technical assistance to and training in Bank safeguards for relevant departments of provincial authorities as well as Contractors and supervision engineers have also already taken place during that same period, with a particular focus on GBV, quarry and borrow pit management, and complaint management, as envisaged in the MAP. The task team is closely monitoring the capacity of all Project stakeholders so that additional training sessions can be scheduled during the remainder of Project implementation if there is still a need for capacity building and/or institutional strengthening activities.

xviii. *Enhanced supervision protocols and institutional strengthening:* The country's volatile security and political situation have made safeguard supervision and reporting a continuous challenge. Management has established an enhanced supervision protocol including a significant increase of the periodicity of Bank supervision missions and field visits. Twelve Bank missions have taken place since August 2017, most of them involving the participation of Bank Management, experienced task team leaders, as well as senior safeguard and GBV specialists. This enhanced supervision has focused not only on the RN2 but also on the other roads financed by ProRoutes. Enhanced Bank supervision will continue in the coming months as the Project is entering an important phase with the resumption of works and will last until the Project's closing. The Bank supervision team is supported by a new satellite office recently opened by the Bank in Goma. The Project's supervision mechanisms, including the supervision engineers and the PIU, have also been significantly reinforced with an enhanced presence in the field, following the termination of the former safeguards supervisor BEGES, whose insufficient presence in the field had been criticized by the Panel in its Investigation Report.

xix. Protection of victims, GBV survivors, complainants and witnesses: Management continues to monitor closely the risk of retaliation against the Requesters, victims, GBV survivors, witnesses and any other members of the community who have been cooperating in the

identification and remediation of Project-related harm. Management has been and remains in frequent communication with the most active of the Requesters. Through written communications and face-to-face discussions with the Minister of Finance, the Provincial Governors of North and South Kivu, Contractors, and the PIU, Management has continued to reiterate the importance of, and sought the authorities' commitment to, protecting all affected individuals from retaliation. Management remains vigilant and committed to continue monitoring this risk, in close contact with civil society representatives.

xx. *Consultations with communities:* In application of the MAP, the PIU has been holding periodic consultations with communities about the updating of the Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) and the compensation plan for the Tongo-Butale quarry, and to inform them of the status of the Project and of the various mechanisms that are available to channel complaints. Some of these consultations have been conducted by a local NGO, RARIP.

Consultations with Requesters and affected people on this Progress Report: Progress in xxi. implementing the MAP was presented by the Bank to local civil society organizations and representatives from the affected communities in Goma on February 12, 2019. Consultations were held by Bank staff without any Government representative and were attended by 21 participants from civil society and affected communities, as well as by one of the Requesters accompanied by a relative. Participants expressed satisfaction for the progress accomplished since May 2018 when the draft MAP was being developed and presented to them by the Bank. They welcomed the approaching resumption of RN2 works and discussed the communication plan being implemented by RARIP to inform communities living along the road. The Requester and relative shared their concerns about the specific situation of the Tongo-Butale quarry, stressing that the level of compensation was insufficient in their opinion. ¹⁴ Participants asked for some clarifications about the GBV risk management system and expressed hope that the system could be maintained beyond the completion of the road works and closing of the Project. Representatives from Indigenous Peoples' groups also suggested that the ProRoutes' Indigenous Peoples' activities should be continued and extended in scope beyond the Project, and acknowledged the accomplishments of the Project's Indigenous Peoples' activities, in particular to promote access to land by indigenous communities.

xxii. *The next Progress Report to the Board:* The next Progress Report will be submitted in 12 months, or when the MAP is completed, or should significant developments occur, whichever occurs first.

-

¹⁴ A compensation plan specifically for former workers and the affected community of the Tongo-Butale quarry has been prepared by the PIU and found acceptable by the Bank. This compensation plan was added to the broader RN2 RAP which was redisclosed on March 5, 2019.

First Progress Report on the Implementation of Management's Action Plan in Response to the Inspection Panel Investigation Report on the Democratic Republic of Congo: Second Additional Financing for the High-Priority Roads Reopening and Maintenance Project

I. Introduction

- 1. This is the first Progress Report to the Board of Executive Directors (the Board) on implementation of the <u>Management Action Plan (MAP)</u> in response to the Inspection Panel <u>Investigation Report</u> No. 124033-ZR on the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) Second Additional Financing for the High-Priority Roads Reopening and Maintenance (ProRoutes) Project (P153836), covering activities and information available for the period September 7, 2018 to March 15, 2019.
- 2. The Project. The Project Development Objective of the ProRoutes Project is to "reestablish lasting road access between provincial capitals, districts and territories in the Project implementation area in a way that is sustainable for the natural environment." In DRC, the need for good roads to connect cities and towns is acute. To date, ProRoutes has rehabilitated 2,300 kilometers and is maintaining 3,000 kilometers of high-priority national roads reconnecting previously isolated cities and provinces—contributing to stability and security in a post-conflict context. The implementing agency for the Project is the Cellule Infrastructures (infrastructure unit) at the Ministry of Infrastructure.
- 3. The Project is supported by a total IDA amount of US\$238 million. This includes an IDA grant of US\$50 million equivalent approved by the Board on March 18, 2008. A first Additional Financing (AF1) in the amount of US\$63.3 million equivalent was approved in June 2011 to scale up ProRoutes activities. On February 18, 2016, a second Additional Financing (AF2) in the amount of US\$125 million equivalent was approved to support further ProRoutes activities. AF2, or "the Project," is the subject of the Request for Inspection and subsequent investigation and reports of the Panel and Management.
- 4. **Request for Inspection**. The Request for Inspection was received by the Panel on September 13, 2017. The Request was submitted by community members living in Goma and its vicinity in DRC. The Executive Directors and the President of IDA were notified by the Panel of receipt of the Request. Management responded to the claims in the request on October 20, 2017 and provided an update to its response to the Board and Panel on November 27, 2017. In its report to the Board, the Panel found the Request eligible and recommended that the Executive Directors authorize an investigation. The investigation was authorized by the Executive Directors on December 8, 2017. On April 27, 2018, the Panel issued its report outlining the findings of the investigation. Management provided its Report and Recommendation to the Executive Directors on August 27, 2018. The MAP was approved by the Board on September 7, 2018.

II. MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN (as approved on September 7, 2018)

- 5. In its 2018 Report and Recommendation in response to the Inspection Panel Investigation Report, Management committed to a detailed set of 28 actions at the local, provincial and national levels to address the impacts suffered by project communities and to improve the capacity of all the actors involved in the supervision of the Project, including the supervision engineers, the provincial authorities, the specialized nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) involved in the management of GBV risks, the Government of DRC and the Bank to better manage the types of issues that arose under the Project. The MAP, which aimed to address the findings of the Panel, consisted of the following key actions:
 - (a) Consultations and disclosure of information: The Bank will require the Project Implemental Unit (PIU) to hold and document periodic consultations with communities in the RN2 area to report on works progress and to invite feedback on potential negative impacts. Such consultations will be held with due attention to local languages¹ and to information being provided to participants. Management will require the PIU to provide the Bank with the materials being presented and the list of participants, in order to make sure that such consultations are comprehensive and inclusive enough.
 - (b) **Project-level GRM:** The Bank will continue to monitor the processing of all complaints received by the Project-level GRM with a view to monitoring that the complaints are adequately and fairly brought to closure. In this context Management will pay particular attention to the closing of GRM cases, the documentation of complaints, the methodology applied to calculate compensation, and any complaints that have been appealed (i.e., elevated to the supervision committees).
 - (c) Management will initiate a review of all project-level GRMs in DRC, with a view to ensuring their strengthening, where needed, based on findings and recommendations of the review. The objective is to ensure that such GRMs have been properly designed to handle not only resettlement-related issues but also any other issues associated with broader social risks.
 - (d) The Project will also continue to ensure effective operation of dedicated GRMs for GBV issues as described below.
 - (e) *GBV*: The Bank will require the PIU to continue to implement (and ensure the Contractor's compliance with) all the agreed GBV training protocol so that all ProRoutes workers are kept aware of the behaviors that will not be tolerated and of the disciplinary consequences of abuses and improper behaviors. Another broader objective is to promote changes in behavior and attitudes towards women and girls, as well as highlighting risks associated with prostitution and early marriage.

-

¹ Swahili and Lingala are used in the Project areas.

Refresher courses will be envisaged as appropriate as well as additional sessions for new hires.

- (f) Management will require the Borrower to ensure that any GBV survivors² who have not received the agreed support from GBV service providers by the closing date of ProRoutes, continue to be able to receive the needed support under other Bank operations in the area—such as the two stand-alone GBV projects. This may require adjusting the areas of intervention of these two operations.
- (g) The Bank will require the Borrower to ensure that the Code of Conduct is enforced and that Contractors take the necessary disciplinary action in accordance with the Code of Conduct. This will require due attention to avoid exposing survivors to retaliation. In accordance with the survivor-centric approach, as recommended by the GBV Task Force, Management will require the Borrower to ensure that the choice of survivors is respected on whether or not to file a complaint in the judicial system. Any retaliation identified by the Bank or brought to its attention will be immediately raised by Bank Management with the DRC authorities.
- (h) Management will screen the Bank portfolio in DRC to identify high-risk operations for GBV and retrofit risk mitigation measures for such operations as appropriate and as guided by the GBV Task Force's recommendations. Further DRC portfolio screenings will be periodically conducted, using the new GBV risk assessment tool currently being developed, as recommended by the GBV Task Force.
- (i) Management will finalize the GBV Good Practice Note which is being developed in response to the GBV Task Force recommendations and which will be included in the roll-out of ESF guidance material later in 2018. Acknowledging that GBV is still an area of intense learning for the Bank, Management will make sure that the GBV Good Practice Note is periodically updated as new information, lessons or best practices are known.
- (j) Quarry exploitation: The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that all quarries and borrow pits are restored by the end of civil works on the roads, as per the applicable contractual clauses and restoration plans. Particular attention will be paid to the safety of quarries and borrow pits, especially for the Tongo-Butale quarry. Whenever possible, restoration plans will try to improve the existing situation for quarry and borrow pit owners and operators. Management will continue to pay attention to any complaint that may be raised by communities as the restoration process progresses.
- (k) The Bank will require the Borrower to closely monitor the exploitation of all ProRoutes quarries and borrow pits to make sure that it is undertaken in full compliance with contractual clauses and applicable safeguard instruments.

3

² Survivors associated with the ProRoutes Project identified after the Project's closing date, will receive GBV support under the two stand-alone GBV projects up to 2 years after the closing of ProRoutes.

Management will require the Borrower to ensure that supervision engineers periodically report on the situation of all quarries and borrow pits being exploited under the ProRoutes' works, so that any non-compliance can be detected early on.

- (l) The Bank will continue to closely monitor the risk of retaliation, and will alert the Congolese authorities if it identifies or receives any information relating to any sign that victims, complainants or witnesses might be intimidated or retaliated against. In this context, particular and close attention will be paid to any concerns relating to the safety of the Requesters and of GBV survivors. Management will continue to stress and document the importance of a no-retaliation policy during all its coming missions and engagements with the national and provincial authorities on ProRoutes.
- (m) The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that identified quarry workers—or communities if workers cannot be identified—who have incurred revenue losses as a result of quarry occupation are compensated proportionately, in particular through the creation of employment-generation opportunities. Management notes that the identification of workers may be complicated by the informality of the labor involved. When workers cannot be identified individually, remedial actions will be implemented at the community level.
- (n) *Impacts on agriculture and livelihoods:* The Bank will require the PIU to update the RN2 Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) once more to reflect all Project-affected people and compensation agreements, including those related to quarry and borrow pit exploitation.
- (o) Community Health and Safety and Security Arrangements: The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that the agreed Humanitarian Law Training by MONUSCO³ is completed for all military personnel involved in the protection of the ProRoutes worksites. Additional training activities will be held if new military personnel are assigned to ProRoutes as a result of the normal rotations of military units.
- (p) Management is currently working on a Good Practice Note for staff on the use of security forces that provides guidance on assessment and management of risks associated with the use of security staff/military to protect project sites. This note includes in particular specific guidance regarding the selection and training of military personnel assigned to the protection of Bank-financed activities, as well as the enforcement of codes of conduct.
- (q) Water pipe rupture, storm water management and road safety: The Bank has requested the PIU to perform a compliance audit to confirm that all 15 water incidents on RN2 have been fully resolved. Whenever feasible, remedial actions should lead to a situation at least equivalent to that which existed for the affected

.

³ United Nations Organization Stabilization Mission in the DRC.

- communities before the start of the works and, whenever possible, an improved situation (as was the case for the Mubimbi camp for internally displaced persons).
- (r) The Bank will continue to closely monitor as part of its supervision water pipe rupture, storm water management and road safety, and require the PIU and Contractor to implement the relevant prevention measures, as per the ESIA and contractual clauses. Management will require the PIU to report, and require the supervision engineers to periodically report, on such compliance. Management will also closely monitor any complaints filed with the GRM relating to these specific areas.
- (s) The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that the Contractor has in place: (i) clear communication to communities about upcoming construction works and how to communicate utility interruption incidents; and (ii) arrangements to provide water supply through water tanks and/or similar temporary provisions to affected communities within 48 hours of any confirmed water interruption.
- (t) Working conditions and occupational health and safety: The Bank will require the PIU to request the Congolese authorities to perform periodic assessments of the RN2 Contractor's facilities to evaluate compliance with applicable labor regulations, including compliance with occupational health and safety requirements and actions to help prevent sexual harassment, and to communicate the conclusions of such assessments to the Bank.
- (u) Supervision and reporting: Management will monitor implementation of all planned institutional strengthening activities for the PIU, the safeguards supervisor, the relevant national and provincial institutions, the supervision engineers and the Contractors. These activities include in particular the hiring of additional safeguards specialists by the PIU, training activities to all relevant institutions, and revisions to the safeguards supervisor's contract.
- (v) Management will continue to ensure that the enhanced monitoring and reporting requirements to the Bank are in place and performing effectively, including communication to the Bank of monthly reports by the various key supervision entities.
- (w) Management will continue to work with the PIU on the geo-mapping of Project activities so that information on works progress can be made accessible to the general public.
- (x) Management will continue to implement enhanced Bank supervision protocols on RN2, including field visits (subject to security conditions).
- (y) Management will continue to implement strengthened Bank supervision protocols on other ProRoutes roads, including field visits (subject to security conditions).

- The Bank will launch a social media monitoring pilot to monitor the Bank's transport portfolio in DRC and identify possible negative reports of Bank-financed activities in social media. Considering the highly innovative nature of this instrument and in accordance with the contract and terms of reference, the Bank will evaluate the results of this pilot after an initial phase of maximum six months to determine if such a monitoring tool brings added value to the Bank in terms of early detection of issues such as negative impacts of Bank-financed activities on communities and livelihoods. The result of the evaluation will also determine whether the pilot can be extended to monitor a broader portfolio of Bank-financed activities and projects.
- (aa) Management will closely monitor the implementing agency's progress in fulfilling conditions that would allow the disbursement suspension to be lifted, so that works can quickly resume on at least selected roads where such conditions have been met.
- (bb) Management will extend the Project's closing date by six months so that remedial actions can continue to be financed and implemented, especially support to GBV survivors.

III. PROGRESS OF MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN IMPLEMENTATION

- 6. *MAP implementation to date.* Since the MAP was approved in September 2018, the Bank has continued to make considerable efforts to support the Borrower's implementation of all agreed actions and measures put in place to remedy and prevent harm to the affected communities. As a result, significant progress has been made in implementing the MAP's 28 actions: 10 actions have been completed, 16 actions are on track and will be monitored until the Project's closing, 1 action is pending the resumption of works⁴ on RN2, and 1 action is not applicable at this point.⁵ Aside from RN2, which is the focus of the MAP, other active ProRoutes road works have also received significant attention, drawing on lessons from RN2 and making sure that the requirements of Bank policy and the Project's safeguard instruments are met. Beyond the ProRoutes Project, important actions have been completed to disseminate lessons and address systemic issues particularly regarding GBV and also the use of military personnel in Bank-financed operations.
- 7. **Preparation and dissemination of Good Practice Notes (GPNs).** Building on lessons from ProRoutes as well as other Bank projects implemented in challenging environments, the Bank has developed a series of GPNs that include risk assessment tools to support task teams with the preparation and implementation of Bank-financed operations. While the GPNs have been issued in the context of the Bank's Environmental and Social Framework (ESF) that became

6

⁴ This action involves the hiring of 20 workers from the Tongo-Butale community by the RN2 Contractor.

⁵ This action relates to the support to be provided to eventual GBV survivors that would not have been completed by the Project's closing date. This action is not applicable at this point since the Project's closing date is being extended. Should a need for continued GBV support be identified after the closing of the Project, the DRC Gender-Based Violence Prevention and Response Project will be able to provide support to GBV survivors along the RN2 road, as needed.

effective on October 1, 2018, they are designed to support task teams working on both new projects being prepared under the ESF, as well as projects that are currently under preparation or implementation that are subject to the safeguard policies that pre-date the ESF. The Bank's previous safeguard policies are expected to run in parallel with the ESF for at least seven years.

- 8. The "Good Practice Note for Addressing GBV in Investment Project Financing involving Major Civil Works" was issued in September 2018 and disseminated to all Bank operational staff. The GPN aims to assist task teams in establishing an approach to identifying risks of GBV, in particular sexual exploitation and abuse and sexual harassment, that can emerge in projects with major civil works contracts and to advise Borrowers accordingly on how to best manage such risks. The GPN has been used in preparing several Bank-financed projects in Africa⁶ and other regions. Currently, active operations in the DRC are introducing additional GBV risk mitigation measures following the guidance in the GPN. This is being undertaken in a phased manner according to the assessed level of risk. The process is projected to be completed before the end of 2019.
- 9. Another GPN, the "Good Practice Note on Assessing and Managing the Risks and Impacts of the Use of Security Personnel," issued on October 1, 2018, is intended to support task teams as they work with Borrowers in assessing and managing risks to the security of project-affected communities and project workers that could arise from the use or presence of security personnel that have been engaged to protect a project. Security personnel may be private or public and may be engaged by the project contractor or by the Borrower. The GPN includes specific guidance regarding the selection and training of military personnel assigned to the protection of Bankfinanced project activities, as well as the enforcement of codes of conduct.
- 10. A third GPN, a "Good Practice Note on Third Party Monitoring (TPM)," issued on June 29, 2018, offers a step-by-step approach for Bank staff to assist Borrowers in establishing third party monitoring for project implementation. The information may also be useful for Borrowers who wish to benefit proactively from such monitoring to improve project performance, in cases where the use of a third party has not been required. The scope of the note is therefore focused on cases where third party monitoring is primarily used to assist the Borrower.⁷
- 11. Lifting of IDA partial suspension of disbursements and resumption of works. All conditions notified by the Bank at the time disbursements were suspended (November 2017) had been met by the time of Bank verification in the field during its September 2018 supervision mission. In addition, several other actions⁸ had been completed by the PIU in October-November 2018. Considering this progress as well as the satisfactory implementation of the MAP,

7

⁶ Guinea Rural Mobility and Connectivity Project (P164543) approved on December 10, 2018 and Chad Rural Mobility and Connectivity Project (P164747) approved on December 19, 2018. Similar projects being finalized in Niger and Guinea Bissau have also incorporated the guidance provided in the GPN.

⁷ Another GPN for Road Safety is in the process of being reviewed at the corporate level as part of the new ESF roll-out and is expected to become available to task teams before the end of the fiscal year.

⁸ These are: (i) updating of the Contractor's environmental and social management plan (C-ESMP); (ii) confirmation by the relevant authorities that the Contractor remains compliant with applicable labor and occupational safety regulations; (iii) confirmation of the compensation plan for the Tongo-Butale quarry; (iv) confirmation by the supervision engineers that the works are still in compliance with contractual and safeguard obligations; and (v) preparation of a communication plan to be implemented once the suspension is lifted and before the works resume.

Management decided to lift the partial suspension of IDA disbursements in December 2018. Since that date, many of the ProRoutes' road works have been restarted. However, works on RN2 are still pending the completion of the communication activities being implemented by a local nongovernmental organization (NGO), the Réseau d'Analystes des relations Internationales pour la Paix dans la Région des Grands Lacs (RARIP), to inform communities of the Contractor's workplan and the available mechanisms to channel eventual complaints, including those that are GBV-related. One of the other ProRoutes' roads, the RN4 connecting Beni to Kasindi, near the border with Uganda, is currently playing a critical role in the Ebola response since it is the only reliable land access to Beni where the Ebola response in North Kivu is being coordinated. The resumption of works on RN4 has been slightly delayed pending the preparation of an Ebola prevention plan. A physician has been hired by the PIU to finalize this document. Works on RN4 are now restarting and should be completed in July 2019. Three other smaller road maintenance contracts are also pending the authorization to resume. Prior to receiving the PIU's administrative order authorizing them to restart works, Contractors must demonstrate that they are in full compliance with safeguard obligations including GBV prevention measures and inform the communities of their workplan. 10 Supervision engineers must also confirm that these conditions are met.

12. Consultations and disclosure of information. Multiple consultations with affected communities have taken place since preparation and approval of the MAP. The first round of consultations was organized August 4-9, 2018 in 22 villages and communities along RN2 to keep them informed of progress and of complaint management (including the functioning of the GRM). A second round of consultations took place on September 25, 2018 to discuss the specific situation of the Tongo-Butale quarry and agree on a compensation scheme. A third round of consultations took place on December 7, 2018 as part of the process to update the RAP of RN2. RARIP was hired by the PIU in January 2019 to conduct this next round of consultations. The first ones started on January 23, 2019 with the objective of informing communities of the lifting of the IDA suspension and the imminent resumption of works, so that affected communities are aware of the timing of the planned road works as well as of the various safeguard instruments and complaint management mechanisms in place under the Project. The PIU will continue to hold periodic consultations with the RN2 communities until the Project closing as per the MAP. All consultations involve translation in local languages (Swahili and/or Lingala as appropriate).

13. *Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM)*. Both the project-level GRM and GRMs across the DRC project portfolio have been evaluated to ensure that local communities can raise their concerns during implementation of Projects. The ProRoutes Project's GRM ¹¹ has been considerably strengthened and communities have been informed on multiple occasions ¹² about the functioning of the GRM and of complaint management for the Project. The GRM has a two-tier organization, with local GRM committees processing complaints as they are registered in the first

⁹ The decision was notified to the Board on December 7, 2018 and to the Congolese authorities on December 10, 2018. ¹⁰ This communication to local communities is still ongoing for the RN2 with the help of RARIP.

¹¹ In total, 156 GRM committees, with 617 committee members, have been put in place on all the ProRoutes roads. For the RN2 only, the GRM operates with 26 active committees and 98 committee members. In agreement with the provincial authorities, multiple field and radio information/sensitization activities have been undertaken to further disseminate information about the functioning of the GRM.

¹² In particular during 22 consultation meetings held from August 4-9, 2018 in villages and communities living along the RN2 road, as well as during the consultations held by RARIP since January 23, 2019.

place, and an appeal mechanism managed by "supervision GRM committees" when there is disagreement on the outcome of the processing. A Geographic Information System (GIS) database of all GRM committees has been established by the PIU with the Bank's technical guidance, to compile statistics on complaints and other information.

- 14. Since the MAP was approved, the number of registered complaints that has been processed and compensated when found eligible or otherwise been denied, has increased from 57 to 97 percent. This demonstrates that the system to process and address complaints is working successfully. Since November 2017, the Bank has been receiving a comprehensive monthly report of the status of all complaints received and processed.
- Dedicated GBV GRMs have also been established on RN2 and other roads with active rehabilitation contracts to review GBV allegations – with the survivors' consent. Complaints have been identified through multiple channels, including through the specialized GBV organizations that provide a pathway for survivors to safely and confidentially disclose GBV-related complaints if they wish to do so. These GBV GRMs have been developed in collaboration with key stakeholders and GBV experts to review allegations and determine whether there is a link to the ProRoutes Project, in line with GBV ethical standards and a survivor-centric approach. As of March 15, 2019, the GBV GRMs had reviewed 34 allegations of rape or sexual assault. Two Bank missions met with GBV GRM representatives and stakeholders in Goma in September 2018 and February 2019 to review progress and provide recommendations to improve the GRM performance, including ensuring that confidentiality and ethical principles are respected. The Bank also recommended that cases be brought to closure in a maximum of eight weeks as per international best practices. The length of the review process by GBV GRMs has been longer than the 8-week objective for some cases. The length of the review process has however been improving over time, as these entities are gaining in experience and capacity and benefiting from the technical support of UNFPA.
- 16. In addition, a review and assessment of project-level GRMs in DRC, with a focus on 11 high-risk projects out of the 20 operations in DRC, was undertaken to improve the functioning and effectiveness of project-level GRMs in the country. While most projects had a Bank-approved GRM, not all GRMs were fully operational and some needed strengthening. Key recommendations to strengthen project-level GRMs are being implemented by PIUs, so that: (i) all project-level GRMs are fully operational; (ii) focal points (committees) responsible for implementing the GRM are properly trained; (iii) there is public awareness of the GRM; and (iv) task teams review GRM logbooks during supervision missions and document their findings in Aide Memoires and Implementation Status Reports. Task teams are also required to ensure that GRMs are fully costed at the project level and that Borrowers include budgetary provisions to cover such costs.
- 17. **Gender-Based Violence allegations.** In line with the recommendations of the GBV Task Force,¹³ the Bank is implementing a survivor-centric approach under the Project to ensure that affected women and girls receive medical, psychosocial and legal assistance, in accordance with their individual needs and preferences. Management has focused first and foremost on helping all

_

¹³ The Global Gender-Based Violence Task Force was formed to strengthen the Bank's response to instances of GBV encountered as part of its operations. The Task Force included a range of members from academia, NGOs, foundations, UNICEF, and government.

identified survivors, regardless of whether the GBV allegations are linked to the Project or not, subject to the survivor's consent and wishes. To this end, specialized GBV organizations coordinated by the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) have been contracted to monitor the GBV risk on RN2 and other ProRoutes' roads under rehabilitation; to provide a pathway for survivors to safely and confidentially disclose GBV-related complaints if they wish to do so; and to offer the needed services.

- 18. In addition to the specialized GBV organizations, dedicated and confidential grievance redress mechanisms (GBV GRM committees) have been established to review each GBV allegation whenever survivors agree to it. These innovative GBV GRMs have been developed in collaboration with key stakeholders and GBV experts to review allegations and assess whether there is a link to the ProRoutes Project, in line with GBV ethical standards and a survivor-centric approach. Irrespective of whether the incident is linked to ProRoutes, survivors who report incidents are provided with access to the same set of basic services.
- 19. Based on the 34 allegations of rape or sexual assault reviewed and closed to date, the GBV GRMs have determined that eight (8) incidents are likely linked to the Project. These eight (8) incidents involve underage girls who have all been offered services by the specialized NGOs contracted by the Project. The remaining 26 allegations reviewed by the GBV GRMs were found either not to be related to ProRoutes or the available evidence is not sufficient to conclude in one way or another. As of March 15, 2019, another 26 alleged incidents of rape or sexual assault are currently under review by the GBV GRMs in addition to the 34 allegations referenced above.
- 20. Beyond the allegations referenced above, 25 adult women reported allegations not involving rape or sexual assault. Of these 25 incidents, the GBV GRMs determined that 13 were likely linked to the Project.
- 21. The Bank has not received any allegation involving an incident that took place since IDA disbursements resumed in December 2018. Only one alleged incident¹⁴ has occurred since all workers were trained in GBV awareness and prevention.
- 22. The Project has provided the same level of support to all individuals who reported allegations of rape, sexual assault or other incidents through the specialized GBV organizations as mentioned above. All survivors have been offered a comprehensive package of support by these organizations, without waiting for the GBV GRM review and regardless of whether the incident can be linked to the Project. As of March 15, 2019, all but one survivor had accepted such assistance and received psychosocial support, medical assistance, and/or legal assistance, based on their needs and preferences. While legal assistance has been provided to 18 survivors, only five (5) of them decided to file a complaint in the legal system. The Bank, through the PIU and UNFPA, is monitoring the conclusions of these legal proceedings. The ProRoutes Project also has established a mechanism to refer GBV survivors to services made available through the two standalone Bank-financed GBV projects that are being implemented in the RN2 area, ¹⁵ fostering complementarities of GBV services offered across the Bank's portfolio.

¹⁴ This GBV incident allegedly took place in June 2018.

¹⁵ The Great Lakes Emergency Sexual and Gender Based Violence and Women's Health project and the DRC – Gender-based Violence Prevention and Response Project.

- 23. The GBV GRMs' reviews regarding the linkages of reported incidents with the Project constitute sufficient evidence, including when alleged perpetrators are known and are listed in the Contractor's payroll, to refer the allegations to the Project Contractors (with the consent of the survivor). Project Contractors are required by the PIU to report on their subsequent due diligence with respect to the allegations as well as any accountability measures taken in application of the codes of conduct signed by their employees. The Bank has been monitoring the administrative measures taken by Contractors and supervision engineers against alleged perpetrators of incidents that have been reviewed by the GBV GRM. None of the alleged perpetrators involved in either the eight alleged GBV incidents with underage girls or the other 13 alleged incidents linked to the Project remains employed on the Project. To help implement the GBV prevention and risk management measures, the RN2 Contractor has also hired under its own initiative a GBV specialist.
- 24. Support to broader GBV activities in the Project area. The specialized GBV organizations financed under ProRoutes and coordinated by UNFPA also have been implementing GBV awareness and prevention activities and providing support to survivors of GBV incidents that are unrelated to ProRoutes but occurred in the Project area. Specifically, 636 survivors (unrelated to ProRoutes) received support and services based on their needs and preference, including 334 in the RN2 area. Stocks of Post-Exposure Prophylaxis (PEP) starter kits¹⁶ have been supplied by UNFPA to health centers located in the Project area. In addition, more than 150 GBV service providers have been trained by UNFPA, including 45 in the RN2 area. Finally, more than 211,000 people (69,000 in the RN2 area) have benefited from behavioral change communication and other GBV information activities.
- 25. **Quarry exploitation.** Compliance of all quarries and borrow pits with Bank policies and safeguard instruments was confirmed by the compliance auditor in May 2018. Such compliance is being verified by supervision engineers who have been reporting on it to the PIU on a monthly basis. As specified in the MAP, the Bank has received from the PIU a copy of all of the supervision engineers' monthly reports. Restoration plans to restore all quarries and borrow pits in compliance with contractual clauses and the Project ESMP have also been completed by the Contractors and are pending works resumption and the completion of quarry and borrow pit exploitation, in order to be executed by the Contractors.
- 26. For the Tongo-Butale quarry, a specific compensation plan has been prepared by the PIU and the provincial authorities in consultation with quarry workers' representatives and other members of the affected community. The compensation plan includes a commitment by the Contractor to create employment opportunities for at least 20 daily workers for about 8 months (equivalent to 160 man-months), which exceeds the losses generated by the illegal exploitation of the quarry, estimated at 120 man-months. The plan was consulted upon with representatives of quarry workers and community members on September 25, 2018. This compensation plan has been reviewed and found acceptable by the Bank and has been included in the broader RN2 RAP.

- 27. *Impacts on agriculture and livelihoods.* Since the MAP was approved, the RN2 RAP has been updated for a second time to reflect the identified negative impacts on communities and the corresponding compensation, as well as the specific compensation measures agreed for the Tongo-Butale quarry. Consultations with affected communities took place on December 7, 8 and 10, 2018. An updated RAP was cleared by the Bank and disclosed in-country and in the Bank's Infoshop¹⁷ on March 5, 2019.
- 28. Community health and safety and security arrangements: Between November 2017 and August 2018, specific humanitarian law training sessions were organized by human rights trainers from MONUSCO for all military personnel involved in the protection of the ProRoutes' worksites. A partnership to this end was formalized between the PIU and MONUSCO, noting that the training costs would be financed under the Project. In addition, all military personnel involved in the Project are now screened following MONUSCO Human Rights' good practice. On September 5, 2018, the PIU sent a letter to all Contractors to remind them that all newly recruited security personnel would need to be trained. As of March 15, 2019, ProRoutes' Contractors have been able to assign security personnel to the worksites from the pool of military personnel trained and screened by MONUSCO. As ProRoutes works start to resume, Management, the PIU and the supervision engineers are closely monitoring the assignment of military personnel since there may be a need for additional protection as workers are deployed on worksites.
- 29. Water pipe rupture, storm water management and road safety. All water supply interruptions caused by the road works on RN2 have been addressed and services have been restored with compensation provided to the affected communities, including the Mubimbi camp for internally displaced persons, which received medicines, renovation of latrines and monetary compensation to all the women in the camp. A specific compliance audit in the field by an independent auditor took place October 8-23, 2018 and confirmed that all water incidents had been resolved satisfactorily. The Contractor also has made a number of additional improvements to the water systems (unrelated to water interruptions caused by the Project) to enhance the quality and reliability of service provision. The PIU wrote to all supervision engineers on September 6, 2018 to request that they monitor and report on any water or road safety incidents in their monthly reports. Also on September 6, 2018, the PIU wrote to all Contractors to request that they communicate their workplan to communities and have specific provisions in place in case of water interruptions. All water-related incidents registered in the GRM have been resolved. No trafficrelated fatalities have been reported on RN2 since the start of the rehabilitation works on that road in March 2017.
- 30. Working conditions and occupational health and safety. Labor inspection authorities have undertaken assessments of the RN2 Contractor's facilities to evaluate compliance with applicable labor regulations, including compliance with occupational health and safety regulations and actions to prevent sexual harassment. Reports from the labor authorities were received by the Bank on October 23, 2018 and confirmed that the RN2 Contractor is compliant with applicable national labor regulations. This includes verification that all workers have work contracts; that compensation is paid in case of injury and full payment of worker's wages is made; that workers have and are wearing protective equipment boots, reflective vests, and helmets; and that

-

¹⁷ The updated RAP is available at: http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/581281551845901669/

measures to prevent sexual harassment and other forms of GBV are in place. Compliance with the ESMP and contractual clauses is being closely monitored by the PIU in coordination with the Contractor and the supervision engineers.

- 31. Supervision and reporting. The Bank has strengthened the monitoring and reporting mechanisms necessary to supervise the Project. Reports by the supervising engineers are submitted by the PIU and reviewed monthly. The country's volatile security and political situation have made safeguard supervision and reporting at the institutional level a continuous challenge. Management has established an enhanced supervision protocol including a significant increase in the frequency of Bank supervision missions and field visits for the ProRoutes Project. Since August 2017, twelve Bank missions have traveled to DRC to visit and supervise Project sites, with the most recent conducted during February 10-15, 2019. Despite challenging security conditions, all major road works have been visited by a Bank mission. Missions have involved the participation of Bank Management, experienced task team leaders, as well as senior safeguards and GBV specialists. This enhanced supervision has focused not only on RN2 but also on the other roads financed by ProRoutes and will continue in the coming months when road works resume and until the Project's closing date.
- 32. The Project's supervision mechanisms, including the supervision engineers and the PIU, have also been significantly reinforced with an enhanced presence in the field, following the disengagement and termination of the former safeguards supervisor, BEGES, whose insufficient presence in the field had been criticized by the Panel in its investigation report. Other experienced organizations (UNFPA and one NGO, Ocean) have been hired to manage the Project's social and environmental activities. Safeguard specialists have been mobilized by the supervision engineers on the five main roads under rehabilitation to monitor environmental and social requirements. This includes the supervision engineer for RN2 (CIRA) who has also hired and deployed a dedicated safeguard specialist in the field. An additional social specialist has been hired by the PIU.
- 33. Recent advances in technology are being used to provide additional information on works' progress. A GIS unit set up in the PIU is being trained and has received technical advice from Bank experts. The PIU has already disclosed a significant amount of geo-referenced information on its website, including information on road conditions for RN2, RN6 and part of RN4, and is planning to add more information on complaint management. All 156 GRM committees have been mapped, including the updated database of complaints. A confidentiality protocol is being prepared to ensure that no sensitive information that could expose the safety of complainants is disclosed.
- 34. The Bank has opened a satellite office in Goma to strengthen and support supervision in the east of the country, with appropriate staffing, and in collaboration with the United Nations. This will help in ensuring stronger supervision support to the ProRoutes Project and other activities in Eastern DRC.
- 35. Institutional strengthening and the capacity to manage preventive and remedial safeguard actions continue to remain a priority. Since the MAP was approved, institutional strengthening activities to build up the national and provincial capacity to manage safeguards have advanced significantly. Training sessions benefiting the relevant departments in the Ministry of Public Works (MPW), as well as the Congolese Environmental Agency (ACE) were held in November

and December 2018 and January 2019. Technical assistance to and training in Bank safeguards for relevant departments of provincial authorities as well as Contractors and supervision engineers also took place during that same period, with a particular focus on GBV, quarry and borrow pit management, and complaint management, as envisaged in the MAP. One additional training targeted at provincial authorities took place in Lubumbashi on February 26-27, 2019. The task team is closely monitoring the capacity of the Project stakeholders so that additional training sessions can be scheduled during the remainder of Project implementation if there still is a need for capacity building and/or institutional strengthening activities.

36. **Risk of retaliation.** Management continues to take the risk of retaliation very seriously, in particular against the Requesters, GBV survivors, witnesses and any other members of the community who have been cooperating in the identification and remediation of Project-related harm. Measures to monitor retaliation have included meeting Requesters and civil society representatives, as well as close coordination with the Congolese authorities to ensure that all stakeholders associated with the Panel investigation remain safe and are not threatened. Management has been and remains in frequent communication with the main Requester. Through written communications¹⁸ and face-to-face discussions with the Minister of Finance, the Provincial Governors of North and South Kivu, and the PIU, Management has continued to reiterate the importance of, and sought the authorities' commitment to, protecting all affected individuals from retaliation.

Consultations with Requesters and Affected People on This Progress Report

- Consultations. The progress in implementing the MAP was presented by the Bank team to local civil society organizations and representatives from the affected communities in Goma¹⁹ on February 12, 2019. 29 representatives from civil society and affected communities received an invitation from the Bank. 20 Consultations were held without any Government representative and were attended by 21 participants from civil society and affected communities. Both requesters were invited to the consultations. One of the Requesters participated, accompanied by a relative. The second Requester declined participation, and also declined to participate in consultations by video, or in a location that would suit him.²¹
- 38. Feedback. Participants expressed satisfaction about the implementation progress accomplished since May 2018 when the draft MAP was being developed and presented to them by the Bank. They welcomed the approaching resumption of RN2 works and discussed the communication plan being implemented by RARIP to inform communities living along the road. The Requester and relative shared their concerns about the specific situation of the Tongo-Butale quarry, stressing that the level of compensation was insufficient in their opinion. A compensation plan specifically for former workers of the Tongo-Butale quarry and the affected community has

14

¹⁸ Four letters on this matter have been sent to the Congolese authorities by the World Bank Country Director in Kinshasa, on December 11, 2017, April 25, 2018, June 21, 2018 and October 17, 2018.

¹⁹ Consultations were held at the Lake Kivu hotel in Goma.

²⁰ Invitations were sent between February 1 and 6, 2019.

²¹ The Bank sent an invitation by email to the second Requester on January 30, 2019. On January 31 after the Requester declined, the Bank offered to meet the Requester in Kigali, either on February 11 or 14, 2019. The Bank also offered to organize an audio or videoconference in another venue and at any other date and time of the Requester's preference.

been prepared by the PIU and found acceptable by the Bank.²² Participants asked for some clarifications about the GBV risk management system and expressed hope that the system could be maintained beyond the completion of the road works and closing of the Project.²³ Representatives from Indigenous Peoples' groups also suggested that the ProRoutes' Indigenous Peoples' activities should be continued and extended in scope beyond the Project, and acknowledged the accomplishments of the Project's Indigenous Peoples' activities, in particular to promote access to land by indigenous communities.²⁴

39. This Progress Report will be provided to the requesters, and publicly disclosed on the bank's website.

IV. NEXT STEPS

40. *The next Progress Report to the Board.* The next Progress Report will be submitted in 12 months, or when the MAP is completed, whichever occurs first. Should there be significant developments of concern that occur within this period, the Progress Report may be advanced to inform the Board as appropriate.

²² This compensation plan was added to the broader RN2 RAP, which was redisclosed on March 5, 2019.

²³ On RN2 support to address GBV concerns will continue beyond project closure.

²⁴ The Panel's investigation report did not identify non-compliance with the Bank's indigenous Peoples Policy.

Table 1. Implementation of Management Action Plan

Proposed Actions

Status Update as of March 15, 2019

1. Consultations and disclosure of information

The Bank will require the PIU to hold and document periodic consultations with communities in the RN2 area to report on works progress and to invite feedback on potential negative impacts. Such consultations will be held with due attention to local languages and to information being provided to participants. Management will require the PIU to provide the Bank with the materials being presented and the list of participants, in order to make sure that such consultations are comprehensive and inclusive enough. Timeline: every 3 months until Project closing.

This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing.

The first consultations on RN2 took place August 4-9, 2018. Consultations focused primarily on the GRM and complaint management. Twenty-two meetings were organized in the communities of Kavumu/Bughire, Irambi/Katana, Kaskeka/Mbinga Sud, Luzira/Tchofi, Rambira, Kalehe Centre, Lushebere, Nyamukubi, Bushushu, Kabushungu, Nyamasasa/Mbinga Nord, Kabulo 1, Bubale 2, Bubale 1, Buganga, Mubimbi, Kalungu, Mvinga Shanga, Bweremana, Kashenda, Kituva/Kirotshe and Lutobogo. The Bank received a summary of the consultations on August 27, 2018. During these consultations, 5 Project-affected Persons contested the amount of the compensation they received. These complaints have been registered and have been handled by the GRM.

A second round of consultations took place on September 25, 2018 to discuss the specific situation of the Tongo-Butale quarry and agree on a compensation scheme.

A third round of consultation took place on December 7, 2018 as part of the process to update the RN2 RAP.

Additional consultations have been scheduled to be held before the actual resumption of works so that communities are aware that works are restarting and of the various safeguard instruments and complaint management mechanisms. These consultations are being undertaken by RARIP, a local NGO with both a network of local focal points in the communities and a good knowledge of the ProRoutes Project. Consultations started on January 23, 2019 and are progressing well. They should be concluded by end March 2019.

Consultation materials and a summary of consultations have been received and reviewed by the Bank.

Regular consultations will continue until closing.

2. Project-level GRM

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
Project-level GRM. The Bank will continue to monitor the processing of all complaints received by the Project-level GRM with a view to monitoring that the complaints are adequately and fairly brought to closure. In this context Management will pay particular attention to the closing of GRM cases, the documentation of complaints, the methodology applied to calculate compensation, and any complaints that have been appealed (i.e., elevated to the supervision committees). Timeline: until Project closing.	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing. Consolidated lists of GRM-registered complaints are sent to the Bank on a monthly basis. The latest list, received on March 14, 2019, includes 1,560 complaints received on all ProRoutes roads, of which: 1,113 have been found eligible and paid, 52 have been found eligible and are being processed for payment, and 395 have been rejected. These complaints do not include GBV allegations, which are processed separately by the dedicated GBV GRMs. They mostly relate to minor losses of agricultural assets. The Bank and the PIU have set up a geo-referenced GIS database of all the GRM committees with, for each of
	them, statistics on complaints, and various additional information.
Management will initiate a review of	This action has now been completed.
all project-level GRMs in DRC, with a view to ensuring their strengthening, where needed, based on findings and recommendations of the review. The objective is to ensure that such GRMs have been properly designed to handle not only resettlement-related issues but also any other issues associated with broader social risks.	As part of a portfolio-wide assessment of environmental and social performance in DRC, project-level GRMs were assessed in all active projects by July 31, 2018 with a particular focus on 11 higher-risk projects. Key findings were that while most projects have a Bank-approved GRM, not all GRMs are fully operational.
	Key recommendations were to ensure that: (i) all GRMs are fully operational; (ii) focal points (committees) responsible for implementing the GRM are properly trained; (iii) there is public awareness of the GRM; and (iv) task teams review GRM logbooks during supervision missions, and results are reflected in Aide Memoires and Implementation Status Reports. This strengthening of project-level GRMs has been taking place on all projects as supervision missions occur.
	Going forward, task teams will ensure that GRMs are fully costed at the project level and that Borrowers include budgetary provisions to cover such costs. Consideration will also be given to using common GRM platforms across several projects (e.g., in the same province or sector). GBV complaints will be handled either by a separate GRM process, or with a special protocol in the project GRM to ensure confidentiality.

The Bank will require the PIU to continue to implement (and ensure the Contractor's compliance with) all the agreed GBV training protocol so that all ProRoutes workers are kept aware of the behaviors that will not be tolerated and of the disciplinary consequences of abuses and improper behaviors. Another broader objective is to promote changes in behavior and attitudes towards women and girls, as well as highlighting risks associated with prostitution and early marriage. Refresher courses will be envisaged as appropriate as well as additional sessions for new hires. Timeline: until Project closing.

This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing.

Between February 27 and March 2, 2018, Heal Africa conducted a 1-day GBV training of all workers on RN2 focusing on the prevention of sexual exploitation, abuse and harassment. 120 workers were trained.

A Training of Trainers of 4 NGOs (ACTED, Heal Africa, PPSSP and CDJP/Kalemie) contracted for the other roads was performed by UNFPA in Goma on July 3-5, 2018, ensuring a coherent and technically sound approach across different NGOs.

Following the training of trainers, all workers of all road contracts have now been trained in GBV prevention:

- Workers on RN6/RN23 were trained on July 11-13, 2018 by ACTED
- Workers on RN27 were trained on July 9-12, 2018 by UNFPA
- Workers on RN4 Beni-Kasindi were trained on July 10-12, 2018 by Heal Africa

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
	Workers on RN4 Dulia-Bondo were trained on July 12-14, 2018 by UNFPA
	Workers on maintenance contracts were trained on July 9-14, 2018 by Heal Africa and on July 10-14, 2018 by CDJP
	With the lifting of suspension notified on December 10, 2018, additional training sessions are being scheduled by Contractors, either as a refresher course for formally trained workers or a regular course for new hires.
	The PIU wrote on August 8, 2018 to all Contractors to alert them that all new hires must be trained prior to the restarting of works and will have to sign the code of conduct.
	The Contractors' management personnel as well as supervision engineers and ACE staff were trained in December 2018 in Kinshasa (totaling 65 participants). The training included a GBV module to remind participants of the GBV risk prevention measures and the necessity to plan for additional GBV training for their entire staff prior to the restarting of works.
	In total, 1,531 workers have been trained in GBV awareness and prevention, as recorded by UNFPA as of March 15, 2019.
	Supervision engineers will report on the hiring and training of workers in their monthly reports.
	To help implement the GBV prevention and risk management measures, the RN2 Contractor also has decided under its own initiative to hire a GBV specialist.
Management will require the	Action not applicable at this point.
Borrower to ensure that any GBV survivors who have not received the agreed support from GBV service providers by the closing date of ProRoutes, continue to be able to	The ProRoutes Project is still active and all identified survivors have received the agreed support based on their needs and preference. The Project's closing date has been extended to February 29, 2020.
receive the needed support under other Bank operations in the area—such as the two stand-alone GBV projects. This may require adjusting the areas of intervention of these two operations. Timeline: arrangements in place by Project closing.	Close coordination and consistency in the GBV approach is being ensured between the ProRoutes Project and the newly approved DRC GBV prevention and response project on the RN2 segment where both projects' activities overlap. Continued GBV support to eventual GBV survivors identified after the Project's closing date

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
	could be provided under the newly approved GBV project up to 2 years after the closing of ProRoutes.
The Bank will require the Borrower to ensure that the Code of Conduct is enforced and that Contractors take the necessary disciplinary action in accordance with the Code of Conduct. This will require due attention to avoid exposing survivors to retaliation. In accordance with the survivor-centric approach, as recommended by the GBV Task Force, Management will require the Borrower to ensure that the choice of survivors is respected on whether or not to file a complaint in the judicial system. Any retaliation identified by the Bank or brought to its attention will be immediately raised by Bank Management with the DRC authorities. Timeline: until Project closing.	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing. Following the review of allegations by the GBV GRM, the PIU has followed up with the supervision engineers who, contractually, can request the Contractor to remove the worker from the Project with due consideration to the survivor's security, if there is sufficient evidence of misconduct. Management has been monitoring accountability measures requested by the supervision engineer and/or taken by the Contractor. As of March 15, 2019, none of the alleged perpetrators in the 21 incidents that have been found by the GBV GRM to be linked to the Project, is working any longer on the Project.
Management will screen the Bank portfolio in DRC to identify high-risk operations for GBV and retrofit risk mitigation measures for such operations as appropriate and as guided by the GBV Task Force's recommendations. Further DRC portfolio screenings will be periodically conducted, using the new GBV risk assessment tool currently being developed, as recommended by the GBV Task Force. Timeline: review completed by August 30, 2018.	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing or completion of retrofitting. The DRC GBV portfolio risk review was completed by August 30, 2018, applying the GBV risk assessment tool that was developed in response to the recommendations of the Global GBV Task Force. Of all the active operations in the portfolio/ pipeline that were prioritized for assessment, based on desk review of likely GBV risks, 4 were assessed as high risk (including ProRoutes), 1 as substantial, 13 as moderate and 4 as low risk. It is noteworthy that of the high and substantial risk projects, only ProRoutes involves civil works posing risks through labor influx, and retrofitting is now complete in that case. The other high- and substantial-risk projects are in the extractives sector, a regional information and communication technology backbone project, in education, and in social development (demobilization and reintegration of ex-combatants), with significantly different drivers of GBV risk from labor influx, although in all cases involving gender power differentials among project stakeholders. A meeting of the Country Team was

jointly with the relevant task teams. Detailed action plans to integrate additional GBV risk mitigation measures were developed for 10 of the 16 projects prioritized based on the risk review and GBV experts identified to work with PIUs on their implementation. The additional GBV risk mitigation measures in March 2019. Management will finalize the GBV Good Practice Note which is being developed in response to the GBV Task Force recommendations and which will be included in the roll-out of ESF guidance material later in 2018. Acknowledging that GBV is still an area of intense learning for the Bank, Management will make sure that the GBV Good Practice Note is periodically updated as new information, lessons or best practices are known. Timeline: October 1, 2018. The GPN provides guidance on appropriate GBV risk mitigation measures based on the level of risk posed by individual operations as well as contextual risk. The GPN has been used in the preparation of all new Bank-financed projects in the transport sector in Africa and other regions. Currently, all active Bank operations in the DRC are introducing additional GBV risk mitigation measures following the guidance provided in the GPN. Managemen has also issued another Good Practice Note relevant for use in the project on how to handle the involvement of security personnel in Bank operations. 4. Quarry exploitation The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that all quarries and borrow pits are restored by the end of civil works on the roads, as per the applicable contractual clauses and restoration plans. Particular attention will be paid to the safety of quarries and borrow pits. They will be implemented once quarries and borrow pits stop being exploited. Regarding the specific case of the Tongo-Butale quarry,	Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
Good Practice Note which is being developed in response to the GBV Task Force recommendations and which will be included in the roll-out of ESF guidance material later in 2018. Acknowledging that GBV is still an area of intense learning for the Bank, Management will make sure that the GBV Good Practice Note is periodically updated as new information, lessons or best practices are known. Timeline: October 1, 2018. The GBV Good Practice Note was finalized and disseminated on October 1, 2018 to the Bank's operational teams as part of the ESF roll-out. The GPN provides guidance on appropriate GBV risk mitigation measures based on the level of risk posed by individual operations as well as contextual risk. The GPN has been used in the preparation of all new Bank-financed projects in the transport sector in Africa and other regions. Currently, all active Bank operations in the DRC are introducing additional GBV risk mitigation measures following the guidance provided in the GPN. Managemen has also issued another Good Practice Note relevant for use in the project on how to handle the involvement of security personnel in Bank operations. 4. Quarry exploitation The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that all quarries and borrow pits are restored by the end of civil works on the roads, as per the applicable contractual clauses and restoration plans. Particular attention will be paid to the safety of quarries and borrow pits, especially for the		portfolio risk assessment for DRC, and a work plan has been agreed for retrofitting projects. High-, substantial- and some moderate-risk projects are prioritized for the first phase, followed by the other moderate- and low-risk projects. A team has been identified to carry out this work jointly with the relevant task teams. Detailed action plans to integrate additional GBV risk mitigation measures were developed for 10 of the 16 projects prioritized based on the risk review and GBV experts identified to work with PIUs on their implementation. The additional Six projects will start detailed work on integrating additional GBV risk
developed in response to the GBV Task Force recommendations and which will be included in the roll-out of ESF guidance material later in 2018. Acknowledging that GBV is still an area of intense learning for the Bank, Management will make sure that the GBV Good Practice Note is periodically updated as new information, lessons or best practices are known. Timeline: October 1, 2018. The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that all quarries and borrow pits are restored by the end of civil works on the roads, as per the applicable contractual clauses and restoration plans. Particular attention will be paid to the safety of quarries and borrow pits, especially for the		This action has now been completed.
The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that all quarries and borrow pits are restored by the end of civil works on the roads, as per the applicable contractual clauses and restoration plans. Particular attention will be paid to the safety of quarries and borrow pits, especially for the This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing. Restoration plans have been prepared and cleared by the supervision engineers for all quarries and borrow pits. They will be implemented once quarries and borrow pits stop being exploited. Regarding the specific case of the Tongo-Butale quarry,	developed in response to the GBV Task Force recommendations and which will be included in the roll-out of ESF guidance material later in 2018. Acknowledging that GBV is still an area of intense learning for the Bank, Management will make sure that the GBV Good Practice Note is periodically updated as new information, lessons or best practices	disseminated on October 1, 2018 to the Bank's operational teams as part of the ESF roll-out. The GPN provides guidance on appropriate GBV risk mitigation measures based on the level of risk posed by individual operations as well as contextual risk. The GPN has been used in the preparation of all new Bank-financed projects in the transport sector in Africa and other regions. Currently, all active Bank operations in the DRC are introducing additional GBV risk mitigation measures following the guidance provided in the GPN. Management has also issued another Good Practice Note relevant for use in the project on how to handle the involvement of
ensure that all quarries and borrow pits are restored by the end of civil works on the roads, as per the applicable contractual clauses and restoration plans. Particular attention will be paid to the safety of quarries and borrow pits, especially for the Project closing. Restoration plans have been prepared and cleared by the supervision engineers for all quarries and borrow pits. They will be implemented once quarries and borrow pits stop being exploited. Regarding the specific case of the Tongo-Butale quarry,	4.	. Quarry exploitation
"Tongo-Butale" quarry. Whenever possible, restoration plans will try to improve the existing situation for quarry and borrow pit owners and operators. Management will continue operators. Management will continue operators. Whenever possible, restoration plans was prepared by the Contractor and cleared by the supervision engineer in November 2017. In September 2018, a Bank mission traveled to the quarry site and confirmed that the exploitation of the Tongo-Butale quarry had ended and that the community	ensure that all quarries and borrow pits are restored by the end of civil works on the roads, as per the applicable contractual clauses and restoration plans. Particular attention will be paid to the safety of quarries and borrow pits, especially for the "Tongo-Butale" quarry. Whenever possible, restoration plans will try to improve the existing situation for quarry and borrow pit owners and	Project closing. Restoration plans have been prepared and cleared by the supervision engineers for all quarries and borrow pits. They will be implemented once quarries and borrow pits stop being exploited. Regarding the specific case of the Tongo-Butale quarry, the restoration plan was prepared by the Contractor and cleared by the supervision engineer in November 2017. In September 2018, a Bank mission traveled to the quarry

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
to pay attention to any complaint that may be raised by communities as the restoration process progresses. Timeline: until Project closing.	understands the need for the restoration plan to proceed given the current safety risk. The Contractor has committed to perform the works when authorized to restart the works.
The Bank will require the Borrower to closely monitor the exploitation of all	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing.
ProRoutes quarries and borrow pits to make sure that it is undertaken in full compliance with contractual clauses and applicable safeguard instruments.	The PIU wrote to all supervision engineers on September 6, 2018 to request that they include a specific paragraph in their monthly reports on compliance of quarry and borrow pits exploitation.
applicable safeguard instruments. Management will require the Borrower to ensure that supervision engineers periodically report on the situation of all quarries and borrow pits being exploited under the ProRoutes' works, so that any non- compliance can be detected early on. Timeline: until Project closing.	No quarry issues have been reported to the PIU and the Bank through the monthly reports prepared by the supervision engineers.
	Particular attention is being paid to this issue by the PIU and the Bank since the resumption of some of the ProRoutes' road works in January 2019.
The Bank will continue to closely monitor the risk of retaliation and will	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing.
immediately alert the Congolese authorities if it identifies or receives any information relating to any sign that victims, complainants or witnesses might be intimidated or retaliated against. In this context, particular and close attention will be paid to any concerns relating to the safety of the Requesters and of GBV survivors. Management will continue to stress and document the importance of a no-retaliation policy during all its coming missions and engagements with the national and provincial authorities on ProRoutes. Timeline: until Project closing and through continuous engagements with the Government more broadly and in the context of two GBV projects in the area.	Since the Panel's investigation visit, Management has received from the Panel as well as a few other sources, several claims of threats or intimidation against the complainants.
	Management sent an official letter to the Government on December 11, 2017 reiterating the absolute necessity to protect complainants, victims, and witnesses against any forms of threat or retaliation.
	Another letter on the same matter was sent by the Country Director on April 25, 2018.
	Following new allegations forwarded by the Panel on June 19, 2018, a new letter was sent to the DRC Minister of Finance (and Bank Governor) on June 21, 2018 and the Country Director talked to the North Kivu Governor.
	The task team met with the Requester on several occasions, including in Kigali in September 2018 to discuss the Requester's security situation.
	Management is in periodic contact with several civil society representatives in the Project area to help ensure

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
	that key stakeholders linked to the Panel investigation are safe.
The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that identified quarry workers—or communities if workers cannot be identified—who have incurred revenue losses as a result of quarry occupation are compensated proportionately, in particular through the creation of employment-generation opportunities. Management notes that the identification of workers may be complicated by the informality of the labor involved. When workers cannot be identified individually, remedial actions will be implemented at the community level. Timeline: until Project closing.	This action is pending the resumption of the RN2 works. Consultations have taken place with quarry workers and community members to agree on a compensation scheme for workers that have been affected by the closing of the Tongo-Butale quarry. The agreed compensation measures have been compiled in a specific compensation plan which has itself been included in the RN2 RAP. The updated RAP was cleared by the Bank on February 18, 2019 and disclosed on March 5, 2019. The Contractor has confirmed its agreement to execute the agreed compensation measures falling under its responsibility, including the hiring of some members from the affected community to create a volume of works that is equivalent or superior to the volume of works lost as a result of the closing. Additional compensation measures, which go beyond the requirements of the MAP, have been agreed between the community, the provincial authorities and the PIU, and are described in the updated RAP. Management will supervise the implementation of the agreed measures until full completion.
5. Impacts	on agriculture and livelihoods
The Bank will require the PIU to update the RN2 RAP once more to reflect all Project-affected people and compensation agreements, including those related to quarry and borrow pit exploitation. Timeline: by September 30, 2018.	This action has now been completed. The RN2 RAP has already been updated once, including the associated consultation process with communities. The process to update the RAP a second time is complete: consultations with affected communities took place on December 7, 8 and 10, 2018. The updated RAP was cleared by the Bank on February 18, 2019 and disclosed on March 5, 2019 both in country (on the ACE website) and in the Bank's Infoshop.
6. Community Health and Safety and Security Arrangements	
The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that the agreed Humanitarian Law Training by MONUSCO is completed for all military personnel involved in the protection of the ProRoutes worksites. Additional training activities will be held if new	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing. A first training session was completed by a MONUSCO human rights trainer on November 7, 2017 for 14 military personnel (7 assigned to site protection and 7 scheduled to

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
military personnel are assigned to ProRoutes as a result of the normal rotations of military units. Timeline: by September 1, 2018 and as needed until Project closing.	replace them after their 2-month rotation). The completion report was received by the Bank on December 6, 2017.
	Training of other military personnel involved in the protection of other ProRoutes' roads was finalized as follows:
	• 37 soldiers from Bunia, Beni and Komanda were trained on May 24-25, 2018
	• 6 soldiers from Gemena were trained on June 10- 11, 2018
	• 8 soldiers from Kalemie, Baraka and Fizi were trained on June 18-19, 2018
	• 6 soldiers from Kisangani were trained on June 20- 21, 2018
	Additional training sessions were organized by the PIU to train newly-assigned military personnel:
	On August 22-25, 2018, 11 soldiers newly assigned to the protection of the RN2's seven worksites were trained by the MONUSCO in Bunia
	On July 17, 2018, five soldiers newly assigned to the protection of the RN4 were trained in Bafwasende.
	On September 5, 2018, the PIU sent a letter to all Contractors to remind them that all newly recruited security personnel need to be trained. So far, Contractors have been able to assign security personnel from among the pool of personnel who had already been trained and no additional military personal have been deployed to protect the ProRoutes worksites. The Bank and the PIU are closely monitoring the situation of RN2 following some concerns expressed by the Contractor that security conditions have recently deteriorated.
	The Bank has formalized a partnership with MONUSCO to assign some of its human rights trainers to the training of ProRoutes' military personnel, with training costs being financed by the Project. The Bank is working on a broader agreement with MONUSCO including all Bank projects in DRC involving military personnel for security protection.

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
Management is currently working on a Good Practice Note for staff on the use of security forces that provides guidance on assessment and management of risks associated with the use of security staff/military to protect project sites. This note includes in particular specific guidance regarding the selection and training of military personnel assigned to the protection of Bank-financed activities, as well as the enforcement of codes of conduct. This note will be disseminated October 1, 2018.	This action has now been completed. The Good Practice Note was finalized and issued on October 1, 2018. It has been disseminated to Bank operational teams as part of the ESF roll-out.
	storm water management and road safety
The Bank has requested the PIU to perform a compliance audit to confirm that all 15 water incidents on RN2 have been fully resolved. Whenever feasible, remedial actions should lead to a situation at least equivalent to that which existed for the affected communities before the start of the works and, whenever possible, an improved situation (as was the case for the Mubimbi IDP camp). Timeline: by October 31, 2018.	This action has now been completed. The compliance audit was performed in the field October 8-23, 2018; it confirmed that all water incidents had been resolved satisfactorily. The Contractor also has made a number of additional improvements to the water systems (unrelated to water interruptions caused by the Project).
The Bank will continue to closely monitor as part of its supervision	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing.
water pipe rupture, storm water management and road safety, and require the PIU and Contractor to implement the relevant prevention measures, as per the ESIA and	The PIU wrote to all supervision engineers on September 6, 2018 to request that they include a specific paragraph in their monthly reports on water and road safety incidents. The Bank is monitoring the resolution/closure of all GRM complaints. Nine complaints related to water interruptions
contractual clauses. Management will require the PIU to report, and require the supervision engineers to periodically report, on such	were registered by the Project-level GRM. All of them were resolved. The task teams is closely monitoring the situation of road
compliance. Management will also closely monitor any complaints filed with the GRM relating to these specific areas. Timeline: until Project closing.	safety. No traffic-related fatality has occurred on RN2 since the start of the RN2 works. As works resume, Management will closely monitor that the relevant prevention measures as per the ESIA and contractual

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
	clauses are effectively implemented, enforced and monitored by the supervision engineers.
The Bank will require the PIU to ensure that the Contractor has in place: (i) clear communication to communities about upcoming construction works and how to communicate utility interruption incidents; and (ii) arrangements to provide water supply through water tanks and/or similar temporary provisions to affected communities within 48 hours of any confirmed water interruption. Timeline: by August 31, 2018, monitored through	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing. The PIU sent a letter on September 6, 2018 to all Contractors instructing them to communicate their workplan to communities, explain how to report water incidents, and put provisions in place in case of any water interruption. During the September 2018 mission, the Bank was able to verify in the field that the agreed provisions had been put in place by the RN2 Contractor. This was again confirmed during the February 2019 Bank's field visits for both RN2 and RN4.
Project closing.	As works resume, any complaint related to water incidents will be channeled and processed through the GRM.

8. Working conditions and occupational health and safety

The Bank will require the PIU to request the Congolese authorities to perform periodic assessments of the RN2 Contractor's facilities to evaluate compliance with applicable labor regulations, including compliance with occupational health and safety requirements and actions to help prevent sexual harassment, and to communicate the conclusions of such assessments to the Bank. Timeline: every six months until Project closing.

This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing.

Letters have been sent by the PIU to the relevant labor inspection authorities:

- On September 6, 2018 to the labor inspection authorities of North and South Kivu
- On September 10, 2018 to the labor inspection authorities of the other provinces with active ProRoutes road works.

In September 2018, the task team met with the labor authorities of North and South Kivu in Goma to clarify the objectives of such labor assessments and agree on methodology and frequency.

The first joint report of the two labor inspection authorities was received by the Bank on October 23, 2018 and was found acceptable. The report confirms that the Contractor is compliant with applicable national labor regulations.

The next report from the labor authorities is expected in April 2019.

9. Supervision and reporting

Proposed A	ctions
------------	--------

Management will monitor implementation of all planned institutional strengthening activities for the PIU, the safeguards supervisor, the relevant national and provincial institutions, the supervision engineers and the Contractors. These activities include in particular the hiring of additional safeguards specialists by the PIU, training activities to all

relevant institutions, and revisions to

the safeguards supervisor's contract.

Timeline: until Project closing.

Status Update as of March 15, 2019

This action has now been completed. Institutional capacity needs at all levels will continue to be closely monitored by the task team until Project closing.

Planned training activities of all key stakeholders have progressed as expected:

- Institutional strengthening activities benefiting relevant departments in the MPW, as well as ACE, have taken place. A first training for MPW staff was completed in Goma during the week of November 23, 2018. Another training for ACE staff was held on December 10-15, 2018. Another training for MPW staff took place in Kisangani on January 30-31, 2019.
- Technical assistance and training have been provided to relevant departments of all the provincial authorities in Bank safeguards, with a particular focus on quarry and borrow pit management and complaint management. A first training was completed in Goma during the week of November 23, 2018. One additional training sessions took place in Kisangani on January 30-31, 2019 and another session was held in Lubumbashi on February 26-27, 2019 attended by about 20 participants from the provinces of Haut Katanga and Sud Oubangui.
- Specific training sessions were organized for ProRoutes' supervision engineers as well as management teams and safeguards specialists of ProRoutes' Contractors, with a particular focus on GBV, environmental and social safeguards, quarries and borrow pits, working conditions, water-related issues, road safety and contract management. A first training attended by 65 participants was completed in Kinshasa on December 10-15, 2018.
- UNFPA and the Social Fund have been contracted by the PIU to provide training and technical support to GBV service providers.
- The safeguards supervisor has been replaced by a different supervision arrangement relying on the

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
	field presence of supervision engineers with an enhanced safeguards-monitoring capacity.
	• The PIU has hired a GBV specialist. An additional social specialist had also been hired but was terminated because of poor fit. A replacement has now been recruited. The PIU also hired a physician to prepare an Ebola prevention plan for road works being implemented in the areas affected by Ebola such as the RN4 from Beni to Kasindi.
	 The RN2 Contractor has hired a GBV specialist in addition to the safeguards specialist required contractually.
	• The task team is closely monitoring the capacity of the above Project stakeholders so that additional training sessions can be scheduled during the remainder of Project implementation if there still is a need for capacity building and/or institutional strengthening activities.
Management will continue to ensure that the enhanced monitoring and	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing.
reporting requirements to the Bank are in place and performing effectively, including communication to the Bank of monthly reports by the various key supervision entities. Timeline: until Project closing.	All required monthly reports following the agreed reporting format have been received by the Bank:
	 August and September 2017 monthly reports were sent to the Bank in November 2017.
	• October and November 2017 monthly reports were sent to the Bank in December 2017.
	• December 2017 reports were received early February 2018.
	• January 2018 reports were received on February 21, 2018.
	• February 2018 reports were received on March 22 and 26, 2018.
	• March 2018 reports were received on May 2, 2018.
	• April 2018 reports were received on June 6, 2018.
	• May 2018 reports were received on July 5, 2018.
	• June 2018 reports were received on July 30, 2018.

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
	• July 2018 reports were received on September 10, 2018.
	• August 2018 reports were received on October 6, 2018.
	• September 2018 reports were received on October 23, 2018.
	• October 2018 reports were received on November 21, 2018.
	• November 2018 reports were received on December 21, 2018.
	• December 2018 reports were received on January 21, 2018.
	• January 2019 reports were received on February 28, 2019
	• February 2019 reports are expected to be received by March 29, 2019
Management will continue to work	This action has now been completed.
with the PIU on the geo-mapping of Project activities so that information on works progress can be made accessible to the general public. Timeline: by October 30, 2018.	A GIS unit has been set up in the PIU and is being trained and advised by Bank experts. The PIU has already disclosed a significant amount of geo-referenced information on its website and is working towards adding more information on complaint management.
	Road conditions for RN2, RN6 and part of RN4 have been recorded and posted. Updated recordings are posted as they become available.
	GIS road mapping through Mapillary has been completed for all the ProRoutes roads.
	All 152 GRM committees have been mapped, including the updated database of complaints as of December 31, 2018. A confidentiality protocol is in place to make sure that sensitive information is not disclosed that could expose the safety of complainants.
Management will continue to implement enhanced Bank supervision	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing.
protocols on RN2, including field visits (subject to security conditions).	The RN2 road was visited five times in 2018 and once in February 2019.

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
Timeline: at least twice a year until Project closing.	As RN2 works are about to resume, the frequency of Bank visits to worksites in the field has been increased to monthly visits for at least the first three months after works' resumption. The task team is also relying on an experienced Bank consultant posted in Goma and Beni to help monitor the situation on the ground.
Management will continue to implement strengthened Bank supervision protocols on other ProRoutes roads, including field visits (subject to security conditions). Timeline: at least once a year until Project closing.	This action is on-track and will be monitored until Project closing. Other ProRoutes roads have all been visited at least once
	since February 2018:
	 The RN6/RN23 was visited once in February 2018. Another mission is scheduled for May 2019, subject to security conditions.
	• The RN4 Dulia-Bondo was visited once in March 2018
	 The RN4/RN27 Kisangani-Luna-Komanda-Goli was visited once in April 2018. Another mission is being explored for April 2019, subject to security conditions.
	• The RN4 Beni-Kasindi was visited once in February 2019. Security and safety (Ebola) constraints are particularly difficult on this road (the planned visit in September 2018 had to be cancelled because of security incidents in Beni). However, the task team is relying on an experienced Bank consultant posted in Goma and Beni to help monitor the situation on the ground.
	Bank's supervision activities in the field were suspended in December 2018-January 2019 due to the post-elections uncertainties and closing of the Bank's Kinshasa office. However, they resumed on January 23, 2019.
The Bank will launch a social media	This action has now been completed.
monitoring pilot to monitor the Bank's transport portfolio in DRC and identify possible negative reports of Bank-financed activities in social media. Considering the highly innovative nature of this instrument and in accordance with the contract and terms of reference, the Bank will evaluate the results of this pilot after	The first phase of this pilot has now been completed by the consulting firm <i>Courage Services</i> hired by the Bank.
	The first progress report was received by the Bank and was discussed with <i>Courage Services</i> on September 12, 2018. Looking at the history of the ProRoutes Project, the progress report highlighted the strong potential of the tool to detect early red flags linked to potential implementation issues, including quarry and water problems. The decision

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
an initial phase of maximum six months to determine if such a monitoring tool brings added value to the Bank in terms of early detection of issues such as negative impacts of Bank-financed activities on communities and livelihoods. The result of the evaluation will also determine whether the pilot can be extended to monitor a broader portfolio of Bank-financed activities and projects. Timeline: by September 1, 2018.	to move to a second phase (scaling up to a portfolio of Bank activities in DRC) has now been taken and Phase 2 is being rolled out to additional projects (four projects added in January 2019 and six more in February 2019).
Management will closely monitor the	This action has now been completed.
implementing agency's progress in fulfilling conditions that would allow the disbursement suspension to be lifted, so that works can quickly resume on at least selected roads where such conditions have been met. Timeline: as soon as conditions are met.	The September 2018 Bank mission concluded that all conditions needed to lift suspension had been met for the ProRoutes roads. For RN2, a 5-point plan was agreed with the Congolese authorities (labor inspection report, compensation plan for the Tongo-Butale quarry, compliance certificates from the supervision engineers, communication plan, updating of C-ESMP). Documentation sent by the PIU confirmed that these five points have been completed.
	On the basis of the documentation communicated by the PIU, the Bank decided to lift the suspension. This decision was notified to the Board on December 7, 2018 and to the Congolese authorities on December 10, 2018.
	Several ProRoutes' works contracts resumed between January 11 and January 15, 2019. Two major road contracts (RN2 and RN4 Beni Kasindi) have however not yet restarted as of March 15, 2019. RN4 could restart as early as March 21, 2019 following the finalization of an Ebola prevention plan and the visit of the task team in February. RN2 could start late March 2019 once the communication activities being implemented by RARIP have been completed. Three other maintenance contracts are also pending.
Management will extend the Project's	This action has now been completed.
closing date by six months so that remedial actions can continue to be financed and implemented, especially support to GBV survivors. Timeline: October 31, 2018.	An extension request was sent by the Congolese authorities to the Bank on October 26, 2018. The closing date has been extended by 12 months by the Bank in order

Proposed Actions	Status Update as of March 15, 2019
	to complete road works and address any pending safeguards or GBV-related issues.

Annex 1: Panel's Table of Findings

Issue	Panel Findings and Key Observations
Project Preparation	DRC's fragile and post-conflict context poses major project preparation and implementation challenges. Institutional capacity constraints in DRC are well known to Management. Furthermore, the Project expanded road works into areas that presented more challenging security conditions than earlier phases. Yet the Project was prepared following institutional arrangements and risk assessments similar to those used for the parent project and the first Additional Financing, and without taking into account their shortcomings and the changing environment.
	The Panel finds that the institutional assessment in the context of Project preparation improperly considered capacity constraints and weaknesses experienced in previous phases of the operation. The Panel also finds that the Project's overall analysis of risks and their impacts, particularly regarding the security risks, was inadequate. Therefore, the mitigation measures fell short of adequately protecting affected communities from harm. The Panel finds Management's design and preparation of the Project in non-compliance with Bank Policies on Investment Project Financing (OP/BP 10.00) and Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01).
Consultations and Disclosure of Information	The Panel notes that due to serious shortcomings in consultations and disclosure of information, the local population could not participate and voice their views on Project design and implementation. The Panel observes that affected communities were left without information about their rights and entitlements under the Bank's policies. The Panel finds Management in non-compliance with the consultation and disclosure of information requirements of the Bank Policies on Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01) and Involuntary Resettlement (OP/BP 4.12).
Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM)	The Panel notes that the Project lacked a functioning GRM for the local communities to raise their concerns during implementation of the Project. The Panel finds Management's failure to ensure the timely establishment of an accessible, transparent, and effective Project GRM in noncompliance with the Bank Policy on Involuntary Resettlement (OP/BP4.12). The Panel understands that following receipt of the Request Management made efforts to ensure the establishment of a GRM for the Project.
Quarry Exploitation	The Panel notes that the exploitation of many quarries used for the Project took place in the presence of military forces and without required documents and adequate processes for commercial negotiation. The Panel finds the exploitation of quarries without the required authorizations, prior commercial agreements and related payments, and quarry management and restoration plans is in violation of the Project's Environmental and

Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) and Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) in non-compliance with Bank Policy on Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01). The Panel further finds that the exploitation of quarries in the specific context of this Project constitutes involuntary resettlement in the form of economic displacement in accordance with Bank Policy on Involuntary Resettlement (OP/BP 4.12), as there was an involuntary taking of land resulting in the loss of assets and income sources of the quarry operators and workers. The Panel notes the importance of providing compensation to quarry operators and workers for their loss of incomes and livelihoods in accordance with OP/BP 4.12. The Panel finds that Management did not ensure an adequate and timely **Impacts on** Agriculture baseline survey of agricultural assets of impacted community members, which were destroyed during quarry exploitation before compensation was paid. Thus, the Panel finds Management in non-compliance with Bank Policy on Involuntary Resettlement (OP/BP 4.12). The Panel notes and welcomes the extensive efforts by Management to correct these deficiencies since receipt of the Request, including updating the Abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan (ARAP). The Panel finds Management failed to identify risks and mitigation **Community** Health and measures associated with excessive use of force by military personnel **Safety** engaged by the Contractor in an adequate and timely manner in noncompliance with the Bank Policies on Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01) and on Investment Project Financing (OP/BP 10.00). The Panel also finds Management in non-compliance with the Bank Policies on Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01), the Environmental Health and Safety (EHS) Guidelines, and Investment Project Financing (OP/BP 10.00) for not adequately identifying and mitigating impacts related to water pipe rupture, storm water and lack of road safety measures. These shortcomings were exacerbated by weak supervision, which did not identify harm to communities, in non-compliance with Bank Policy on Investment Project Financing (OP/BP 10.00). Working The Panel notes the occurrence of serious infractions related to payments to **Conditions and** Project workers and poor working conditions affecting their health and safety. **Occupational** The Panel finds Management's failure to adequately monitor or provide Health and implementation support to safeguard workers' health and safety in noncompliance with Bank policies on Environmental Assessment (OP/BP **Safety** 4.01), Investment Project Financing (OP/BP 10.00), and the Bank's EHS Guidelines. The Panel did not find instances of child labor in the Project.

	Management acknowledged issues related to workers' health and safety following receipt of the Request. The Panel welcomes the improvements since then regarding issuance of worker contracts, ID checks, retroactive payment for exchange rate losses, working conditions, and strengthened supervision of labor issues.
Gender-Based Violence (GBV)	The Panel finds Management in non-compliance with Bank Policies on Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01) and Investment Project Financing (OP/BP 10.00) for not properly assessing the gender-based violence risks considering the endemic GBV rates and the high vulnerability of women and girls in the Project area, and for the lack of appropriate mitigation measures to address the high risks of GBV that led to serious harm to women and girls in the community.
	The Panel further finds Management in non-compliance with Bank Policy on Investment Project Financing (OP/BP 10.00) for failing to supervise the implementation of measures to mitigate the risks of gender-based violence, or to identify and propose measures to redress harm caused by the Project.
	The Panel acknowledges and welcomes the substantial efforts undertaken by Management after the receipt of the Request to seriously address the GBV issues related to the Project.
Supervision	The Panel finds Management's failure to monitor the Project and provide adequate implementation support to address weaknesses in the Project's complex system of monitoring and supervision, to capture implementation problems, or to propose corrective actions in noncompliance with Bank Policies on Investment Project Financing (OP/BP10.00) and Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01).
	The Panel acknowledges and appreciates Management's efforts to understand and address the concerns of the Requesters and the community after they raised their issues with the Panel. During its investigation visit the Panel witnessed improvements in the Project. The Panel finds Management in compliance with Bank Policy on Investment Project Financing (OP/BP 10.00) after receipt of the Request, due to its proactive and systematic supervision with adequate expertise focused on problem solving.